# Market assessment

Connectivity solutions for schools in Eastern, Western and Southern Africa





Deloitte.

# Disclaimer

Market Assessment: Connectivity Solutions for Schools in Eastern, Western and Southern Africa © 2024 by <u>UNICEF & ITU Giga initiative</u> is licensed under <u>CC BY-NC-SA 3.0 IGO</u> ()(S)

The assessment in this document is framed by the market approach taken by UNICEF's Supply Division in innovating and shaping product and service markets for the benefit of children today, and future generations of children.

While Giga is an initiative of the ITU and UNICEF, the descriptors, lexicon and focus of the market assessment is that of UNICEF's Supply Division alone, with its many years of experience creating healthier sustainable markets for products and services that help children to survive and to thrive.

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this report do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of ITU or UNICEF concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. Dotted and dashed lines on maps represent approximate border lines for which there may not yet be full agreement. The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers' products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by ITU or UNICEF in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. Errors and omissions excepted, the names of proprietary products are distinguished by initial capital letters.

The market assessment contained in this report was conducted by Deloitte as part of an established long term arrangement (LTA) for the provision of market research, intelligence and advisory services, based on a competitive bidding process. All reasonable precautions have been taken by ITU and UNICEF to verify the information contained in this publication. However, the published material is being distributed without warranty of any kind, either expressed or implied. The responsibility for the interpretation and use of the material lies with the reader.

The opinions, findings and conclusions expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect the views of UNICEF, ITU or their membership.

### **Table of contents**



**Executive summary** Overview of main insights

**Overarching insights** Barriers, market shortcomings & recommended actions



2

**Country-level insights** Market assessment



# 1 Executive summary Overview of main insights

# To support Giga with positively influencing the school connectivity market in Africa, a market assessment has been conducted in 9 focus countries in Eastern, Western and Southern Africa

#### Introduction

- "Giga" is an initiative from UNICEF and the International Telecommunication Union (ITU), which has the aim to connect all schools in the world to the internet by 2030
- To achieve this objective, Giga designs and recommends interventions to positively influence the market and improve access to affordable and quality school connectivity
- To support Giga with positively influencing the market for school connectivity in Eastern, Western and Southern Africa, a market assessment is conducted
- The scope of the market assessment is focused on 9 focus countries<sup>1</sup>, on the last-mile connectivity market and on the fiber, wireless and satellite connectivity market segments

#### Approach

- The market assessment is based on **desk research** and **interviews with connectivity suppliers** and **subject matter experts** (e.g. from UNICEF, ITU, Deloitte). Furthermore, an **industry consultation** has been conducted at **Africa Tech Festival** (November 2023) to discuss and validate the main findings
- The market assessment is built bottom-up from a **country-level** assessment of the connectivity market in the **9 focus countries**, which is brought together in a **regional synthesis** for each of the three regions (EAC, ECOWAS and SADC<sup>2</sup>) as well as an **overarching overview** of the identified barriers, root causes and recommended actions
- In each of the 9 focus countries, the market assessment provides insights into the **broader context** (e.g. connectivity status, access to electricity), **the fiber, wireless & satellite market segments** (e.g. market players, pricing, trends) and the **enabling environment** (e.g. regulations, access to finance)
- Subsequently, the market health is assessed based on UNICEF's 7 market dimensions<sup>3</sup> resulting in an overview of the identified market shortcomings and their root causes
- Recommended actions for Giga on how to positively influence the market by addressing the identified root causes are provided on a regional level (in the regional syntheses), and are
  linked to UNICEF's 4 market-shaping levers<sup>4</sup>

#### **General market characteristics**

- Overall, in the school connectivity markets across the 9 focus countries, it has been found that the availability of connectivity solutions as well as the experienced barriers to school connectivity differ for urban, semi-urban and rural areas
- In urban areas, the fiber backbone extends to all main urban areas across the country, and mobile (mostly 4G) connectivity is also available. Because of high population density and high level of commercial activity, profitability of suppliers in urban areas is generally high, which facilitates the provision of school connectivity. However, in some countries (e.g. Malawi, Sierra Leone, Zimbabwe), also in urban areas there are significant barriers to school connectivity such as the affordability of connectivity and a lack of access to electricity (Continued on next page)

Notes: 1) Kenya, Rwanda, Nigeria, Sierra Leone, Benin, South Africa, Botswana, Malawi, Zimbabwe; 2) the East African Community (EAC) assessment covers Kenya and Rwanda, the Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS) assessment covers Nigeria, Sierra Leone and Benin, and the Southern African Development Community (SADC) assessment covers South Africa, Botswana, Malawi and Zimbabwe; 3) Acceptability, affordability, availability, competition, delivery, funding security and quality; 4) Increase market information, reduce transaction costs, balance supplier & buyer risks and improve access to finance & technology



# The school connectivity market varies between urban and rural areas, with large MNOs driving the market and new technologies emerging in the market (e.g. LEO satellite internet)

#### **General market characteristics (continued)**

- In semi-urban / semi-rural areas, deploying fiber often is a challenge given the larger distances between customers and the scaling of deployment costs, but there is often mobile coverage (3G/4G) and Fixed Wireless Access (FWA). However, the lower density of population, businesses and schools reduce the profitability of suppliers and their economic incentive to invest in deploying infrastructure. Besides the fact that the barriers of affordability and access to electricity are more severe further away from the main urban areas, there are also additional barriers such as higher cost of providing maintenance & after-sales support and access to finance for infrastructure investments
- Lastly, in each of the 9 focus countries, there are rural & remote areas where there is often no fiber or mobile network available and satellite internet is perceived as the most viable connectivity option. In these deep rural areas, connecting schools in the 9 focus countries is considered difficult, given that the high fragmentation of demand and challenging natural environment results in low revenue density and high investment & operating costs for suppliers. As for satellite connectivity, affordability of connectivity, providing maintenance & after-sales and security of equipment are considered significant challenges

#### **Market players**

- The **connectivity market** in the 9 focus countries is largely concentrated in the **mobile segment of the market (3G/4G)**. Fiber internet connectivity only covers a small percentage of the overall connectivity market. The satellite internet market is emerging in most countries, and the entrance of LEO satellite internet (e.g. Starlink, Eutelsat OneWeb, Amazon Project Kuiper) could provide a competitive new connectivity solution
- In most focus countries, the connectivity market is mostly driven by 2 or 3 Mobile Network Operators (MNOs) and in some countries there is a one dominant MNO with a >60% market share (e.g. Safaricom in Kenya, MTN in Rwanda, Econet in Zimbabwe)
- Besides the MNOs, there are often a significant number of Internet Service Providers (ISPs) offering fiber, mobile or satellite connectivity directly to customers, but most ISPs are small and operate locally

#### **Market trends**

- Overall, across the focus countries the affordability of connectivity is increasing when considering the price of connectivity as percentage of Global Net Income (GNI) per capita, with
  the price of mobile connectivity nearing Broadband Commission's target of 2% of GNI per capita in many countries. However, in some countries (e.g. Malawi, Zimbabwe) this target is
  still far away
- The entrance of **LEO satellite internet** is considered a promising trend in the connectivity market, given that it can provide a **competitive solution particularly in (semi-)rural areas** and that it will increase the **level of competition** in the market
- Other technology trends include the roll-out of 5G by the main MNOs as well as more niche connectivity solutions such as community networks and Fixed Wireless Access (FWA) using unlicensed frequencies (e.g. TV White Space) which could serve as a low-cost connectivity solution for underserved areas

Note: 1) Increase market information, reduce transaction costs, balance supplier & buyer risks and improve access to finance & technology

# Barriers to school connectivity range from digital literacy to affordability of connectivity and access to finance, and a total of 37 root causes underlying these barriers have been identified

#### **Barriers to school connectivity**

- A distinction is made between **usage gap** (i.e., percentage of schools which are covered by a good-quality internet network (>3G) but are not connected) and **coverage gap** (i.e., percentage of schools which are not covered by a good-quality internet network (>3G))
- In 6 of the 9 focus countries (Kenya, Rwanda, Nigeria, Benin, South Africa and Botswana), the coverage gap is relatively small (<20% of schools) and the key barriers exist in closing the usage gap</li>
- In **3 of the 9 focus countries** (Sierra Leone, Malawi, Zimbabwe) on the other hand, there are not only key barriers in the usage gap for schools that are covered by a good-quality network but also significant barriers to increase network coverage and close the coverage gap
- To overcome the usage gap, access to electricity, affordability of connectivity & devices, security of connectivity equipment & devices and providing maintenance & after-sales support are considered some of the main barriers for school connectivity across the 9 focus countries, and these are particularly severe in rural areas
- To overcome the **coverage gap**, a lack of **business viability** for suppliers to invest in infrastructure and **access to finance** are considered some of the main barriers

#### Market shortcomings & root causes

- A variety of market shortcomings and a total of 37 root causes have been identified across the 9 focus countries, which can be addressed by Giga to positively influence the market and help suppliers provide more connectivity to schools
- Examples of identified root causes include a high cost of wholesale internet prices (e.g. because of countries being landlocked or limited competition in the middle-mile market), high cost of networking equipment (e.g. because of import duties, inflation, lack of foreign currency/unfavorable exchange rates), and a lack of access to finance for smaller players (e.g. because of difficulty to access Universal Service Fund (USF) funding, development aid or private sector financing)
- In the EAC region, some important root causes include the perceived hesitance from schools & teachers to transition to digital learning as experienced by suppliers, the lack of electricity infrastructure, limited competition in the mobile market and theft or vandalism of equipment, devices & energy infrastructure
- In the ECOWAS region, root causes of market shortcomings revolve around a high price of connectivity due to high inflation, limited competition in the first-mile and high cost for maintenance & after-sales support to customers. Furthermore, root causes underlying the difficulty of expanding network coverage include the lack of access to affordable finance and the low business viability to expand to rural areas for suppliers given the low population density, low disposal income per capita and challenging natural environment

(Continued on next page)



# A total of 30 recommended actions are provided to address the root causes and positively influence the market

#### Market shortcomings & root causes (continued)

In the SADC region, there are major differences in the market shortcomings and root causes experienced across countries. In South Africa, the low reliability of electricity
infrastructure and theft & vandalism are some of the main root causes for the remaining usage gap. In Botswana, the high price of connectivity given that the country is landlocked
and high cost for infrastructure development & maintenance are some of the main challenges. In Malawi and Zimbabwe, important root causes include the high inflation and the
lack of access to foreign currencies (e.g. US dollars), which is reflected in the high cost of importing equipment, lack of electricity and lack of access to affordable finance

#### **Recommended actions**

- A variety of possible solutions have been identified resulting in a total of 30 recommended actions for Giga
- **Examples** of recommended actions (for each of UNICEF's 4 market-shaping levers<sup>1</sup>) include:
  - Increase market information: for example, include the proximity of other potential customers (town hall, health clinic, etc.) and proximity of existing infrastructure/electricity in Giga's connectivity map of schools, or create a dashboard with prices for school procurement contracts to help governments benchmark what an appropriate price is
  - **Reduce transaction costs**: for example, look for opportunities for (cross country) pooled procurement of last-mile school connectivity and devices to bring down prices
  - Balance supplier & buyer risk: for example, establish long-term agreements (5-10 years) with Internet Service Providers (ISPs) to reduce their risk and ensure return on investment
  - Improve access to finance & technology: for example, create more operational expenditure (OPEX)-oriented financing vehicles to cover the recurring costs of connectivity (e.g. to accommodate for satellite connectivity)

#### **Potential next steps**

- A 'catalogue of recommended actions' has been developed, covering all 30 identified recommended actions, for consideration by the Giga team. This catalogue can serve as a starting **point**, from which the Giga team should assess which of the proposed actions will be pursued and when
- After **prioritizing** the **market-influencing actions**, a **roadmap** should be defined to plan the activities in time (from short-term to long-term)
- Lastly, the Giga team is encouraged to leverage the **relationships with suppliers** as developed during the market assessment (through interviews and industry consultation), and to **continue strengthening the collaboration** among governments, market players and other relevant organizations to further capitalize on the recommendations

# 2 Overarching insights from assessment Barriers, market shortcomings & recommended actions

# Definitions | Market dimensions & market levers

The market assessment is based on UNICEF's approach to influencing markets, where markets are assessed on 7 market dimensions and can be influenced through 4 market-shaping levers

### **UNICEF's 7 Market Dimensions**

Dimension	Desired situation	
Acceptability	Products are culturally appropriate and well-adapted for low-income settings	
Affordability	Prices are low enough to meet government's ability & willingness to pay	
Availability	Sufficient volumes of appropriate connectivity solutions are available and easily accessible	
Competition	There is a competitive and reliable supplier base (e.g. no monopoly and low barriers to entry)	
Delivery	Products & services are delivered reliably, cost effectively and on time	
Funding security	Market players have sufficient access to finance	
Quality	Products meet quality standards	

### **UNICEF's 4 Market-shaping Levers**



**Increase market information**: helping businesses assess the market potential and identify market opportunities, through demand forecasting and information communication



**Reduce transaction costs**: lowering the cost of delivering products & services through pooled procurement (resulting in greater economies of scale), variant optimization (resulting in streamlined demand) and/or harmonizing quality standards (lowering barriers to entry)



**Balance supplier & buyer risks**: making contracts more attractive or feasible through special contracts with non-standard terms (e.g., financing structures)



**Improve access to finance & technology**: supporting suppliers with gaining access to finance & technology through local industry engagement and supplier financing



## Barriers to school connectivity

### The availability of connectivity solutions and the barriers to school connectivity<sup>1</sup> vary across the 9 focus countries and differ for urban, semi-urban and rural areas

	Urban	Semi-urban / semi-rural	Rural & remote
General characteristics			
Availability of connectivity solutions	Across the 9 focus countries, the <b>fiber</b> backbone extends to all main urban areas across the country; <b>mobile</b> (mostly 4G) connectivity is also available	In semi-urban & semi-rural areas in the 9 focus countries, there is often no middle-mile fiber available, but there is <b>mobile</b> coverage (3G/4G) and Fixed Wireless Access ( <b>FWA</b> )	In each of the 9 focus countries, there are rural areas where there is often no fiber or mobile network available and <b>satellite</b> internet is perceived as the most viable connectivity option
Market characteristics	Densely populated area and high level of commercial activity, resulting in <b>high profitability</b> of connectivity suppliers	Lower density of population, commercial activity and schools, but <b>manageable</b> required investment costs for connectivity	High fragmentation of demand as well as a challenging natural environment results in low revenue density and high investment & operating costs, thus <b>low profitability</b> of suppliers
Usage gap barriers <sup>2</sup>			
Digital literacy	Digital illiteracy is a <b>challenge</b> in all countries except South Africa and Botswana	The issue of digital illiteracy <b>increases</b> further away from the main urban areas	Particularly in rural & remote areas, digital illiteracy hampers uptake of connectivity solutions
Affordability of connectivity	Affordability of fiber is a challenge, particularly in Malawi and Sierra Leone. Wireless connectivity provides a lower-cost alternative and affordability is generally good, with some exceptions (e.g. Zimbabwe, Malawi and Benin)	Affordability of wireless connectivity is generally good, with some exceptions (e.g. Zimbabwe, Malawi and Benin)	Affordability of satellite internet is a challenge in rural & remote areas, given the relatively high price of satellite internet and low purchasing power in rural areas; however, prices of satellite internet are decreasing
Affordability of devices	Devices (phones, tablets) are a <b>large cost component in</b> <b>the overall digitalization</b> of a school, and affordability is a challenge	<b>Similar to urban areas</b> , but prices of devices may be higher because of distribution cost	<b>Similar to urban areas</b> , but prices of devices may be higher because of distribution cost
Access to electricity	Access to electricity is <b>relatively good in urban areas</b> , except in Benin, Sierra Leone, and Malawi	Access to electricity <b>deteriorates</b> further away from the main urban areas	In rural areas, access to electricity is a <b>major challenge</b> , with the exception of South Africa and to a lesser extent Kenya
• Security (vandalism & theft)	Vandalism & theft of equipment and devices <b>pose a barrier</b> for the uptake of connectivity	Security concerns are <b>higher in more remote areas</b> , and mobile tower infrastructure might get targeted	Vandalism & theft of equipment, devices and power infrastructure is a <b>larger issue in rural areas</b>
Maintenance & after-sales	Maintenance & after-sales can be provided <b>efficiently</b> in urban areas	Maintenance & after-sales support becomes <b>more</b> <b>challenging</b> as distance from support centers increases	In rural & remote areas, maintenance & after-sales is a <b>significant challenge</b> given the large distance from suppliers
• Quality	Generally, quality is <b>not considered a major barrier</b> , especially in urban areas with access to fiber & 4G	Quality will depend on the strength of the wireless network but generally is <b>not considered a major barrier</b>	Quality of GEO satellite internet <b>might not suffice</b> for certain functions (e.g. videoconferencing due to high latency)
Coverage gap barriers <sup>3</sup>			
Business viability	NZA	<b>Expanding fiber</b> to semi-urban areas is considered <b>not</b> <b>economically viable</b> (e.g. large upfront investment costs, fragmentation of demand)	<b>Expanding fiber or 4G</b> to rural & remote areas is considered <b>not economically viable</b> (e.g. low population density/fragmentation of demand). For <b>satellite</b> internet, providing <b>maintenance &amp; after-sales</b> support is the <b>main</b> <b>challenge</b> for the business viability
Funding security	N/A	<b>Smaller ISPs lack access to finance</b> (e.g. from Universal Service Fund (USF)) to expand their coverage	<b>MNOs</b> have <b>difficultly to gain funding</b> for expanding to rural & remote areas (e.g. high interest rate, inadequate USF implementation, inflation & foreign currency shortages)

Notes: 1) The barriers have been identified in the context of school connectivity, but may also be applicable to other segments of the connectivity market in the 9 focus countries; 2) Usage gap barriers refer to the barriers to connectivity which are experienced in areas where there is coverage of (fiber/mobile (>3G)) internet; 3) Coverage gap barriers refer to the barriers for expanding coverage of fiber/mobile (>3G) to underserved areas; Sources: Interviews, Deloitte analysis

## Market shortcomings & root causes

A variety of market shortcomings and root causes have been identified across the 9 countries, which can be addressed by Giga to improve the market

Barrier	Market shortcoming	Root causes	Applicable countries <sup>3</sup>
Isage gap barriers <sup>2</sup>			
Digital literacy	Suppliers experience a lack of	1 • Suppliers experience hesitance from schools & teachers to transition to digital learning	Kenya, South Africa
	uptake due to digital illiteracy	<ul> <li>Low internet penetration rate resulting in low familiarity</li> </ul>	Kenya, Rwanda, Sierra Leone, Benin, Malawi
		<ul> <li>High cost of first-mile / middle-mile bandwidth (wholesale internet prices) for landlocked countries having no direct access to international connectivity</li> </ul>	Botswana, Malawi, Zimbabwe
		<ul> <li>High cost of first-mile / middle-mile bandwidth (wholesale internet prices) due to limited competition in the first-mile</li> </ul>	Sierra Leone, Benin, Malawi
		<ul> <li>High cost of first-mile / middle-mile bandwidth because of lack of in-country data centers or Internet Exchange Points (IXP)</li> </ul>	Botswana
	Price of connectivity is high	<ul> <li>High cost of networking equipment (e.g. import duties, inflation, lack of foreign currency/unfavorable exchange rates)</li> </ul>	Sierra Leone, Malawi, Zimbabwe
		<ul> <li>High cost of infrastructure development &amp; maintenance</li> </ul>	Botswana
Affordability of connectivity		<ul> <li>High cost for maintenance &amp; after-sales support to customers</li> </ul>	Botswana, Sierra Leone, Malawi
		<ul> <li>High cost of licenses &amp; spectrum (e.g. scarcity of spectrum, lack of foreign currency (license fees in US dollars))</li> </ul>	Kenya, Malawi
		10 • High inflation undermining profitability on longer-term contracts	Sierra Leone
		11 • Limited competition resulting in high supplier power & higher prices (e.g. due to gov't regulations, lack of available spectrum)	Kenya, Rwanda, Sierra Leone, Benin, Zimbab
		12 • Low GNI per capita which is reflected in government budgets	Rwanda, Sierra Leone, Malawi, Zimbabwe
	<ul> <li>Low available government budget for school connectivity</li> </ul>	13 • Need for more advocacy on school connectivity in the public agenda	Nigeria, Kenya
		14 • Volatility of the yearly available government budget (for school connectivity)	Malawi
Affordability of devices	Price of devices is high	15 • High cost of devices (e.g. import duties, inflation, lack of foreign currency)	Kenya, Sierra Leone, Malawi, Zimbabwe
		16 • Lack of electricity infrastructure	Rwanda, Sierra Leone, Benin, Malawi, Botswa
Access to electricity	<ul> <li>Lack of electricity limits the uptake of connectivity, particularly in rural</li> </ul>	• Electricity needs to be paid in US dollars and there is a lack of foreign currency or unfavorable exchange rate resulting in high cost	Zimbabwe
,	areas	18 • Inadequate structure of schools which limits the possibility of deploying rooftop solar panels	Sierra Leone
		19 • Low reliability of electricity infrastructure	South Africa

Overview of identified market shortcomings & root causes<sup>1</sup> (1/2)

Notes: 1) The market assessment reflects the perspective of connectivity suppliers as retrieved through interviews, complemented with desk research. The insights have been validated with subject matter experts from UNICEF, ITU and Deloitte, but have not been confirmed with governments or schools; 2) Usage gap barriers refer to the barriers to connectivity which are experienced in areas where there is coverage of (fiber/mobile) internet; 3) These refer to countries where the root cause has been identified, but they may also apply in other countries; Sources: Interviews, Deloitte analysis

12

## Market shortcomings & root causes

A variety of market shortcomings and root causes have been identified across the 9 countries, which can be addressed by Giga to improve the market

Barrier	Market shortcoming	Root causes	Applicable countries <sup>4</sup>
Usage gap barriers <sup>2</sup>			
	Theft & vandalism pose a barrier for the uptake of connectivity	20 • Theft or vandalism of equipment, devices & energy infrastructure	Kenya, Nigeria, Sierra Leone, South Africa
<ul> <li>Security (vandalism &amp; theft)</li> </ul>	Security concerns	• In some countries there are areas with security concerns (e.g. terrorism threat) which result in inability to do installation & maintenance, or a high cost of doing so (due to security measures)	Kenya, Nigeria
Maintenance & after-sales		• Large distance from main support centers (resulting in high costs for allowances and fuel)	Sierra Leone, Botswana
	<ul> <li>Challenge of providing maintenance &amp; after-sales support in rural areas</li> </ul>	23 • Difficult landscape (e.g. mountainous terrain) & lack of general road infrastructure	Sierra Leone
		• Security concerns (e.g. terrorism threat) pose a barrier for providing adequate support	Kenya
• Quality		<ul> <li>Lack of business viability to invest in high-quality network</li> </ul>	Botswana, Malawi
	Low quality of connectivity	<ul> <li>Low-income levels resulting in preference for low-cost low-quality options (e.g. unlicensed frequencies)</li> </ul>	Kenya, Rwanda
Coverage gap barriers <sup>3</sup>			
	• Lack of profitability in rural areas	• Low revenue density (low population density) and difficulty to achieve economies of scale	Kenya, Sierra Leone, Botswana, Zimbabwe
		<ul> <li>Lack of demand from rural areas (e.g. low disposal income)</li> </ul>	Kenya, Sierra Leone, Zimbabwe
		<ul> <li>Lack of existing middle-mile fiber/mobile infrastructure</li> </ul>	Nigeria, Sierra Leone, Malawi, Zimbabwe
Business viability		• Inability to deploy certain connectivity solutions because of the landscape (e.g. FWA requires line- of-sight, which is not feasible in mountainous areas)	Sierra Leone
		• High costs of infrastructure development (e.g. difficult landscape, lack of general road infrastructure)	Kenya, Sierra Leone, Malawi, Zimbabwe
		• High cost of installation, maintenance & after-sales support	Sierra Leone, Malawi
		<ul> <li>Areas of opportunity for a more effective implementation of the USF</li> </ul>	Nigeria, Malawi
		<ul> <li>High cost of capital (high interest rate)</li> </ul>	Kenya, Nigeria, Sierra Leone, Malawi, Zimbabw
• Funding security	<ul> <li>Lack of access to finance by market players</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Lack of foreign currency / unfavorable exchange rates and investment contracts require to be paid in US dollars</li> </ul>	Zimbabwe
		Lack of access to finance for smaller players (difficulty to access USF funding or development aid)	Kenya, Nigeria
		<ul> <li>Lack of access to long-term (development) funding to cover the recurring cost of connectivity</li> </ul>	Sierra Leone

Overview of identified market shortcomings & root causes<sup>1</sup> (2/2)

Notes: 1) Please note, the market assessment reflects the perspective of connectivity suppliers as retrieved through interviews, complemented with desk research. The insights have been validated with subject matter experts from UNICEF, ITU and Deloitte, but have not been confirmed with governments or schools; 2) Usage gap barriers refer to the barriers to connectivity which are experienced in areas where there is coverage of (fiber/mobile) internet; 3) Coverage gap barriers refer to the barriers refer to the barriers for expanding coverage of fiber/mobile to underserved areas; 4) These refer to countries where the root cause has been identified, but they may also apply in other countries; Sources: Interviews, Deloitte analysis

🚽 giga

13

# Catalogue of recommended actions

### Increasing market information can help suppliers identify market opportunities, and can help lower the cost of school connectivity

### Catalogue of recommended actions (1/3)

Recommended action	Ex	planation of how the action can address identified market shortcomings	Root causes addresse
Market lever: increase market information			
<ul> <li>Include the proximity of other potential customers (town hall, health clinic, etc.) in Giga's connectivity map of schools (e.g. as part of a score of the attractiveness of a school)</li> </ul>	•	Information on potential other customers around schools can encourage infrastructure investments into underserved areas	27, 28
Include the <b>proximity of existing telecommunication infrastructure</b> in <b>Giga's connectivity</b> <b>map</b> , to help suppliers assess the difficulty to connect	•	Information on existing infrastructure helps suppliers assess the required investment to connect schools, thereby lowering risk	29, 31
Include access to electricity and the proximity of schools/communities to electricity infrastructure in Giga's connectivity map	•	As access to electricity is an enabling requirement for connectivity, this helps suppliers & government assess which schools can be connected more easily	16
Include the <b>quality of the (physical) structure of schools</b> in <b>Giga's connectivity map</b> to help suppliers assess the feasibility of installing solar panels alongside connectivity equipment	•	In areas where there is no electricity, connectivity needs to be provided in combination with solar panels; however, the structure of schools need to be able to hold rooftop solar panels	18
Publish information on electricity projects/RFPs, such that connectivity providers can piggyback	•	Publishing information about new electricity projects can help suppliers identify new business opportunities (as electricity is an enabling requirement for connectivity)	16
Support governments in sharing their long-term plans of school connectivity projects	•	Increasing market information of upcoming school connectivity projects enable market players to spot business opportunities and plan accordingly	12, 13, 14
Create a <b>dashboard with prices for school procurement contracts</b> to help governments benchmark what an appropriate price is (could be a sub-indicator in ITU's ICT prices dashboard)	•	An international benchmark can help governments assess what a suitable price is to pay for schoo connectivity (based on some key characteristics (e.g. size of schools, distance from existing infrastructure etc.), facilitating cost efficiency in case of low available government budgets	12, 13
Track the quality of school internet and support governments in enforcement of service- level agreements as specified in school connectivity contracts	•	Tracking of quality of internet can help governments enforce the quality requirements as specified in school contracts (service-level agreements)	25, 26
Share best practices (e.g. from Rwanda) on bulk bandwidth purchasing agreements with other countries	r •	Some landlocked countries (e.g. Rwanda) have successfully established long-term bulk purchase agreements to bring down cost of bandwidth	3
Sharing of best practices on training of communities for local support & maintenance, particularly for satellite technology (less complex than other connectivity technologies)	•	Maintenance and after-sales support is considered a high cost component for rural areas; sharing of best practice trainings can help lower the costs	8, 22, 23, 24
Create an <b>overview of relevant initiatives</b> that focus on school connectivity to <b>help suppliers</b> <b>spot opportunities</b> for partnerships or funding	•	An overview of relevant initiatives can help market players (particularly small ISPs) to engage in partnerships and access funding	36

Note: 1) The numbers in this column refer to the identified root causes as presented on slides 9 & 10 Sources: Interviews, workshop with UNICEF & ITU, Deloitte analysis

# Catalogue of recommended actions

Transaction costs can be lowered through pooled procurement of last-mile connectivity as well as through national initiatives to reduce first- & middle-mile connectivity costs

### Catalogue of recommended actions (2/3)

ecommended action	Explanation of how the action can address identified market shortcomings	Root causes addressed
Market lever: reduce transaction costs		
Look for opportunities for <b>pooled procurement of last-mile school connectivity</b> to bring down prices	<ul> <li>Bringing together multiple schools in one procurement contract can bring economies of scale and better return on investment of suppliers, by reducing overhead of procurement processes, enable bulk procurement of network equipment and more efficient roll-out &amp; maintenance</li> <li>It is recommended to consider the characteristics of the different connectivity technologies and existing infrastructure by pooling schools which can be served efficiently with the same type of connectivity solution, to enhance economies of scale and to account for supplier characteristics (e.g. licenses, capabilities, existing infrastructure)</li> </ul>	6, 7, 8
Look for opportunities for cross-country pooled procurement of satellite school connectivity	<ul> <li>As for satellite internet, cross-country pooled procurement might even be possible to fully utilize economies of scale as there is less dependency on existing infrastructure and footprint of existing market players. Differences in government procurement processes, licensing regimes, suppliers' network of partners for maintenance &amp; support and supplier's ground station infrastructure should be considered</li> </ul>	6, 8
Look for opportunities for <b>pooled procurement</b> of last-mile connectivity <b>with other public organizations</b> within <b>communities</b> (e.g. town hall, health center, police station)	<ul> <li>Pooled procurement as a community of which the school is a part of improves the return on investment of supplier infrastructure investments</li> </ul>	6, 8, 27
Look for opportunities for <b>pooled procurement of devices</b> to bring down prices	<ul> <li>Access to affordable devices is a prequisite for connectivity; pooled procurement brings economies of scale and reduces price per device</li> </ul>	15
Explore <b>bulk procurement of bandwidth</b> to bring down prices, particularly for landlocked countries	<ul> <li>Assisting governments (particularly of landlocked countries) in making long-term agreements for international bandwidth capacity can lower the costs of wholesale connectivity prices (e.g. best practice of Rwanda)</li> </ul>	3, 4
Explore opportunity to build local data centers for education content to reduce peering costs	<ul> <li>Local (in-country) data centers can reduce the cost of peering data internationally; Giga can support with assessing the business case</li> </ul>	5
Promote regulatory requirements to <b>enhance competition</b> in the last-mile (e.g. <b>open access</b> middle-mile infrastructure, requirements for the <b>sharing of unused frequencies</b> )	<ul> <li>Giga can advocate for regulations to enhance competition in the last-mile, which could reduce prices of last-mile connectivity solutions</li> </ul>	11
Explore <b>possibilities to reduce reliance on a single first-mile operator</b> (potentially by advocating for the entrance of new infrastructure players)	<ul> <li>The reliance on a single backbone operator may in some countries lead to high wholesale prices; advocating for a new entrant could help increase competition, resulting in lower wholesale prices</li> </ul>	4

Note: 1) The numbers in this column refer to the identified root causes as presented on slides 9 & 10 Sources: Interviews, workshop with UNICEF & ITU, Deloitte analysis

# Catalogue of recommended actions

# Through addressing supplier risks and facilitating access to finance & technology, Giga can help improve the market environment for last-mile connectivity suppliers

### Catalogue of recommended actions (3/3)

ecommended action	Expla	anation of how the action can address identified market shortcomings	Root causes addresse
Market lever: balance supplier & buyer risk			
Orchestrate an <b>integrated approach to connectivity</b> , including electricity, devices and training through combined contracting		Electricity, devices and training are key enabling requirements for connectivity; through combined contracting, this enlarges the market of school connectivity (as more schools can be included)	1, 2, 15, 16
Include <b>market players in the planning of school connectivity initiatives</b> , to increase supplier engagement and appetite for school connectivity and to ensure effective & efficient roll-out	• N a	Market players express their desire to be included in the planning of school connectivity, to jointly assess the required quality & solution	7, 29, 30, 31
Ensure that the <b>risk of inflation is well-managed</b> in connectivity contracts (e.g. agree on price in US dollars and then get paid in the equivalent value of the local currency at the time of delivery)		nflation can make connectivity contracts unprofitable; adequate price indexation or contracting in US Dollars can address this risk	10
Provide <b>long-term contracts</b> (5 to 10 years) to ISP's to reduce their risk and ensure Return on Investment (ROI)		Longer-term contracts reduce supplier risk, and enables suppliers to make investments based on the perspective of longer-term revenues	7, 31
Explore possibility of <b>allowing market players to include monetization models</b> as part of school connectivity contract	• A t	Allowing market players to include monetization models (e.g. advertisement videos of local businesses, paid public Wi-Fi) can increase profitability and reduce prices for schools	12, 13
Market lever: improve access to finance & technology			
Set up a <b>dedicated financing vehicle</b> to provide <b>low-interest loans</b> for middle-mile connectivity		n countries with high interest rates, financing infrastructure development is a challenge (particularly for smaller players)	33, 34, 35
Support <b>smaller players in accessing funding</b> from the Universal Service Fund, development aid and private sector financing		Smaller players experience difficulties in accessing funding; supporting them through these processes enable them to engage in school contracts	36
Create more <b>OPEX-oriented financing vehicles</b> to cover the recurring costs of connectivity (e.g. to accommodate for satellite connectivity)		Suppliers indicate that most (development) funding is focused on CAPEX investments; there is a need for OPEX-oriented financing	37
Support governments with accessing development funding earmarked for school connectivity	а	n some countries with low government budgets, school connectivity may be considered a luxury and other investments are prioritized if there is no external development funding specifically for school connectivity	12, 13, 14, 33
		nnovative monetization models can enable cost sharing by schools with the community,	12. 13
Develop a <b>proposition for monetizing connectivity by schools</b> (e.g. paid public Wi-Fi)	• lı ir	ncreasing affordability of connectivity	12, 13

Note: 1) The numbers in this column refer to the identified root causes as presented on slides 9 & 10 Sources: Interviews, workshop with UNICEF & ITU, Deloitte analysis

**giga** 16

# 3 Country-level insights Market assessment



government has set

connectivity, but the

overall budget is

**Delivery: Lack of** 

although electricity

compared to other

countries in Africa

capita<sup>4</sup>

ambitious goals for school

relatively low given the relatively low GNI per

**electricity** prevents uptake

of connectivity solutions, especially in rural areas,

coverage is relatively good

**illiteracy** prevents uptake

of internet in schools

# Kenya | Broader context & status of school connectivity

More than half of schools in Kenya are not connected to the internet, but the government is committed to connect all schools by 2030 as per their National Broadband Strategy



Notes: 1) Gross national income at Purchasing Power Parity (PPP), with gross national income defined as the gross domestic product plus net receipts from abroad of compensation of employees, property income and net taxes less subsidies on production; 2) Connectivity of schools as found from Giga's Kenya Opportunity Brief Giga's; please note that this is not aligned with Giga's connectivity map, as data on connectivity per school is largely unavailable (blue colour) 3) The Wiley 'Digital Skills Gap Index' measures a country's digital development in terms of digital skills on 6 pillars (e.g. digital skills institutions, government support for bridging the digital skills gap); 4) Data on government expenditure on school connectivity has not been found, but the available government budget has been compared among the 9 focus countries by looking at GNI per capita and government expenditure on education as percentage of GDP; Sources: Giga, UNICEF, WorldBank, Wiley, Deloitte analysis

# Kenya | Fiber internet market

The market for fiber internet is quite fragmented with four main providers, but uptake amongst the population is low and prices are high compared to the GNI per capita

### Key insights into the fiber internet market

	• Five fiber optic international submarine cables land in Kenya. This international	Stores.	Key takeaways
Coverage	<ul> <li>bandwidth is further transported through the National Optic Fiber Backbone Infrastructure (NOFBI), which spans over 6,400 km and touches all 47 counties</li> <li>The population with a fixed internet connection is below 2%</li> </ul>	— Fiber backbone	+ Competition: there is a large number of ISPs, resulting in significant competition
Market players	<ul> <li>There is significant competition in the fixed connectivity market, with many Internet Service Providers (ISPs) (387)</li> <li>In terms of subscriptions, Safaricom is leading in the fixed market with a market share of 36%, followed by Faiba (24%), Wananchi (22%), and Poa! Internet (15%)</li> </ul>	Fixed internet subscriptions (2023) 4% 15% 36% 22% 24% Safaricom Faiba Wanainchi Poa Internet Others	+ Affordability: prices for fixed internet are average but still significantly above Broadband Commission's target of
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>The price for fixed internet service has gone down in the past years (from ~40% to now 17% of GNI per capita), but still is significantly above Broadband Commission's target of 2% of GNI per capita</li> <li>Price of fixed broadband is \$1,76 per Mbps per month in Kenya, scoring average compared to the 9 other assessed countries</li> <li>Quality of fixed internet is relatively low in Kenya, ranking 158<sup>th</sup> out of 181 in terms of fixed broadband quality in Ookla's Speedtest Global Index</li> </ul>	Broadband prices as % of GNI per capita <sup>1</sup> Fixed 40% 20% 0% 2014 2016 2018 2020 2022	<ul> <li>2% of GNI per capita</li> <li>+ Competition: certain market players indicate th they recognize the market opportunity of connecting schools in Kenya</li> </ul>
Market trends	<ul> <li>Market players recognize the market opportunity of school connectivity, given that it involves connecting so many sites</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>There is no bigger opportunity for us; there is no company that has 15000 sites. To connect all of these schools is a strategic pillar for us.</li> <li>Infrastructure provider 29</li> </ul>	

Note: 1) Broadband prices as found in ITU's 'ICT prices dashboard', in which the yearly price for the cheapest offer by the market leader is compared with GNI per capita Sources: Company websites, ITU, Cable.co.uk, CIO Africa, Techweez, Ookla, Interviews, Deloitte analysis

Kenya

Fiber

that ket ing



# Kenya | Wireless internet market

Although there is limited competition in the mobile internet market, affordability is relatively good in Kenya

### Key insights into the wireless internet market

Coverage	• Around 93% of the population have good mobile broadband coverage (3G/4G)	• 3G/4G coverage	<ul> <li>Key takeaways</li> <li>+ Availability: high mobile coverage across the country and population</li> </ul>	
Market players	<ul> <li>There are three major Mobile Network Operators: Safaricom, Airtel Kenya and Telkom Kenya. These players also own most of the tower infrastructure</li> <li>The mobile internet market is dominated by Safaricom with a market share of 66% of subscriptions, followed by Airtel (28%) and Telkom (5%)</li> <li>Besides the MNOs, there are market players (e.g. Poa! Internet, Mawingu) that provide Fixed-Wireless Access (FWA) connectivity in semi-urban and rural areas</li> </ul>	Mobile internet subscriptions (2022) 5% 6% 8 Safaricom Airtel Telkom Others	<ul> <li>Competition: there is a dominant mobile operator, which result in increased prices for customers</li> <li>Affordability: the price of</li> </ul>	
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>Price of mobile connectivity is at 3% of GNI per capita, and on average \$0,59 USD per GB of mobile data which is considered to be relatively affordable</li> <li>Innovative players like Mawingu and Poa! Internet provide low-cost connectivity solution (~\$10 USD per month for 4 Mbps)</li> <li>Kenya's median mobile speed is 22 Mbps download and 9 Mbps upload, which ranks Kenya 104th out of 141 countries</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>The main MNOs are not entering the Fixed Wireless</li> <li>Access (FWA) market, because their main play is mobile and fiber, while we are in FWA. You pay 1500 shilling (~\$10 USD) for 4 Mbps ISP</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Affordability: the price of mobile connectivity is relatively low in Kenya</li> <li>Affordability: some innovative market players can provide low-cost connectivity in semi-urban and rural areas</li> </ul>	
Market trends	<ul> <li>Safaricom announced the activation of 5G in with planned expansion to 150 sites across nine towns in 2023</li> <li>Alphabet is working with Liquid Telecom on delivering internet by using lasers through its 'Taara' project</li> <li>Poa! Internet is exploring innovative monetization models to connect underserved areas, enabling cost sharing within the community</li> </ul>	<b>GSMA</b> August 2022 5G gets boost in Kenya with successful spectrum assignment	<ul> <li>Quality: Kenya ranks low amongst other countries in terms of mobile broadband speed</li> </ul>	



# Kenya | Satellite internet market

The satellite internet market in Kenya is active with new market players joining and established market players developing new offerings

### Key insights into the satellite internet market

		Remote areas we will not do with fiber, but we will do	Key takeaways
Coverage	• Kenya is covered by <b>GEO/VSAT</b> satellites and Starlink's <b>LEO satellites</b>	satellite. Satellite we don't use for backhaul anymore, but for us it is a last-mile technology. - Infrastructure provider	<ul> <li>Availability: GEO satellite internet is available in Kenya and LEO satellite internet has also recently become available</li> </ul>
Market players	<ul> <li>In 2021 five companies were licensed to operate in the satellite internet market in Kenya, including Globalstar and Viasat Kenya</li> <li>Since July 2023, Starlink has started its operations in Kenya, providing LEO satellite internet</li> </ul>	Globalstar	+ Competition: several active market players in the satellite internet market
	<ul> <li>Kenya is facing challenges with regards to technical know-how in the industry which slowed down the growth of this industry</li> </ul>	STARLINK VIasat.	<ul> <li>Affordability: satellite internet is relatively expensive compared to other connectivity options</li> </ul>
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>A monthly subscription for Starlink is \$42 USD and a one-off price for equipment and shipping of ~\$600 USD, offering high-speed and low latency internet <sup>1</sup></li> </ul>	We are launching LEO satellite service together with our partner. It is still in testing phase, but it is a promising technology.	<ul> <li>Quality: LEO satellite offers a high-quality connectivity solution for areas where there is no fiber or mobile coverage</li> </ul>
Market trends	<ul> <li>Starlink started their operations in Kenya and partnered with Karibu Connect as a first authorized reseller</li> <li>Following Starlink, Safaricom is set to launch LEO satellite internet services through a partnership with AST SpaceMobile</li> </ul>	July 2023 Safaricom Partners with AST SpaceMobile to Compete with Starlink's Presence in Kenya	

Note: 1) Prices based on online available information on residential subscription price (source: Starlink Insider) and these have not been verified for school connectivity Sources: Company websites, Starlink Insider, Interviews, Deloitte analysis



Satellite

Kenya

# Kenya | Enabling environment

Access to finance is a challenge in Kenya, particularly for smaller players; the many regulatory changes may also pose a challenge for existing or new market players



G4

- Licenses to operate in the telecommunication market in Kenya are issued by the Communications Authority (CA)
- The government has initiated a range of pro-business reforms over the last few years, including regulations on starting businesses and obtaining access to electricity
- The Finance Act has also seen various reforms over the past years (2019, 2020, 2023), introducing new taxes, including a Digital Service Tax. Some sources indicate that the oscillation between business reforms and conflicting taxation policies raise uncertainty over the long-term plans for improving the investment climate
- In 2023 the government reversed a rule in Kenya's National ICT policy that required ICT firms to have at least 30% substantive Kenyan ownership to be licensed

The Kenyan regulator charges 1% of gross revenue: 0.5% to Universal Service Fund (USF) for marginalized areas and 0.5% to sustain themselves.

- ISP

Kenya's telecom regulation maturity is classified by ITU's ICT Regulatory tracker as **Generation 4: 'Integrated regulation**' <sup>1</sup>



- The 'PPP Act 2021' seeks to expand opportunities for Public-Private Partnerships in Kenya. Despite these measures, Foreign Direct Investments (FDI) is still recovering from the COVID-19 pandemic. Communications and Media is considered one of the leading sectors in terms of FDI in Kenya
  - The government should make the USF funds more accessible for smaller players. Currently often 200-page proposals need to be submitted to get access, and that is not feasible for smaller ISPs with limited resources.

#### Access to finance indicators

- 5 Exchange rate to USD: 0.0066 (2023)
- Government Debt to GDP (% of GDP): **67.3%** (2022)
- ) Interest rate: **10.5%** (2023)



### Key takeaways

- Competition: oscillation in regulations for digital services and investments may raise uncertainty for (international) new entrants
- Funding security: it is difficult for smaller players to access the Universal Service Fund
- Funding security: interest rate is relatively high (10.5%), which may hamper infrastructure investments

Notes: 1) The ITU ICT Regulatory Tracker distinguishes four generations in telecom regulation maturity: G1 – Command & control approach, G2 – Early open markets, G3 – Enabling investment & access, G4 – Integrated regulation; 2) Domestic Credit to Private Sector refers to the financial resources provided to the private sector (such as through loans or purchases of non-equity securities) that establish a claim for repayment (source: OECD) Sources: ITU, World Bank Development Indicators, Trading Economics, International Trade Administration, UNCTAD's Investment Report 2022, Investment Monitor, Crunchbase, OECD, University of Oxford, Interviews, Deloitte analysis



# Rwanda | Broader context & status of school connectivity

Only 22% of schools in Rwanda have meaningful connectivity, with access to electricity and digital literacy posing barriers for expanding connectivity





1010 1010

#### Government support for school connectivity

- The Rwandan government has implemented the **One Laptop per Child (OLPC) program**, which has distributed over 200,000 laptops to primary school students across the country. This program helps to create a culture of technology and innovation from a young age
- In March 2023, **government ministers visited** the first **school** that was **connected** to the **internet via Starlink**

#### Electricity

• Access to electricity is **major barrier**, particularly in rural areas



### **Digital literacy**

- Rwanda has a score of 4.5 on the Wiley 'Digital Skills Gap Index', which ranks Rwanda 4<sup>th</sup> out of 26 countries in Sub-Saharan Africa
- Digital literacy is relatively low in Rwanda: **30%** of the population in Rwanda **used the internet** in 2021

### Key takeaways

- Affordability: the government is committed to providing ICT and highspeed internet to schools
- Acceptability: although digital literacy is relatively low in Rwanda, the OLPC program includes training of teachers
- Affordability: although the government is committed to expanding connectivity, available budget is expected to be low given the relatively low GNI per capita <sup>2</sup>
- Delivery: lack of electricity in rural areas increases costs for internet connectivity solutions

Notes: 1) Gross national income at Purchasing Power Parity (PPP), with gross national income defined as the gross domestic product plus net receipts from abroad of compensation of employees, property income and net taxes less subsidies on production; 2) Data on government expenditure on school connectivity has not been found, but the available government budget has been compared among the 9 focus countries by looking at GNI per capita and government expenditure on education as percentage of GDP; Sources: Giga, BCG, GSMA, WorldBank, Leonecom, Sierraloaded, Deloitte analysis



# Rwanda | Fiber internet market

The government of Rwanda has made interventions to bring down cost of bandwidth; however, affordability of fiber remains a challenge

### Key insights into the fiber internet market



Note: 1) Broadband prices as found in ITU's 'ICT prices dashboard', in which the yearly price for the cheapest offer by the market leader is compared with GNI per capita Sources: Giga, ITU, Rwanda Utilities Regulatory Authority, UN-OHRLLS, Ookla, Rwanda Today, ISP, Cable.co.uk, Interviews, Deloitte analysis

### Key takeaways

Fiber

+ Availability: the fiber network spans most of the country and international bandwidth is available

Rwanda

- **Affordability:** despite successful government **interventions** to bring down costs, affordability of fixed broadband remains a **challenge**
- + **Competition:** there are multiple larger FNOs competing in the market
- + Quality: quality of fixed broadband is relatively high in Rwanda

# Rwanda | Wireless internet market

There is a well-established 4G network in Rwanda, and mobile connectivity is relatively affordable; however, competition is limited

### Key insights into the wireless internet market

Coverage	<ul> <li>The 3G/4G network in Rwanda covers 98% of schools, and the 4G network covers 97% of population</li> </ul>	School coverage       No coverage 2G 3G/4G Data unvailable       2%     98%       0%	<ul> <li>Key takeaways</li> <li>+ Availability: Rwanda has achieved nearly universal coverage of 3G/4G (98% of schools are covered)</li> </ul>
Market players	<ul> <li>The 4G infrastructure market used to be fully owned by Korea Telecom Rwanda Networks (KTRN), but in July 2023 the Utilities Regulatory Authority (RURA) has modified the license of KTRN to allow other companies to deploy 4G networks</li> <li>MTN is the market leader in the 4G market with 66% of subscriptions. Airtel is another significant player with 21% of subscriptions. The remaining 13% of 4G subscriptions is covered by 18 different ISPs</li> </ul>	Market share 4G subscribers (2022) Others Airtel 21% 66% MTN	<ul> <li>Competition: dominance of one market player with a 66% market share of 4G subscriptions (MTN); the 4G infrastructure market used to be a monopoly, but this has recently been changed</li> </ul>
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>Price of mobile connectivity is relatively low in Rwanda (at 3% of GNI per capita, and on average \$0,55 USD per GB of mobile data)</li> <li>The opening of the 4G infrastructure market, is expected to reduce the cost of wholesale 4G which will also reduce consumer prices</li> <li>The speed of mobile broadband in Rwanda is average with 27 Mbps down- and 8 Mbps upload speed</li> </ul>	Connecting July 2023 Korea Telecom Rwanda Networks loses 4G infrastructure monopoly	<ul> <li>+ Affordability: the price of mobile connectivity is relatively low in Rwanda and is near the target of 2% of GNI per capita</li> </ul>
Market trends	<ul> <li>The government of Rwanda is preparing to pilot 5G internet by the end of 2023. The government is establishing 5G related infrastructure as part of the revised National Broadband Policy and Strategy from October 2022. The government aims to have a total of 60 5G sites in operation by 2025</li> </ul>	The <b>New Times</b> February 2023 <b>Rwanda set to pilot 5G internet</b>	

Sources: Giga, ITU, Rwanda Ministry of ICT & Innovation, Connecting Africa, Cable.co.uk, Ookla, The New Times, Interviews, Deloitte analysis

Rwanda

Wireless

School coverage

# Rwanda | Satellite internet market

LEO satellite internet has become available in Rwanda and the government is collaborating with market players to make LEO satellite internet available to schools

Key insights into the satellite internet market

Coverage	• Rwanda is <b>covered</b> by Starlink's <b>LEO satellites</b> and by <b>GEO/VSAT satellites</b>	February 2023 SpaceX's Starlink Licensed in Rwanda
Market players	<ul> <li>Several providers offer GEO/VSAT internet (Vizocom, Ntvsat and Globaltt)</li> <li>In early 2023, Starlink entered the market in Rwanda as currently the only provider of LEO satellite internet</li> <li>The Rwandan Space Agency (RSA) indicates that Starlink's services have the potential to increase the competitiveness in the broadband services sector</li> </ul>	STARLINK <b>N</b> TVsat
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>The Minister of ICT and Innovation states that the Starlink's LEO internet is about three times faster than the available products on the Rwandan market at almost the same price point</li> <li>Price of Starlink satellite internet is around \$39 USD per month with a one-off equipment &amp; shipping price of ~\$460 USD <sup>1</sup></li> </ul>	The <b>New Times</b> February 2023 Starlink internet is fast and affordable, ICT Minister says
Market trends	<ul> <li>The Rwanda Space Agency (RSA) has announced that Starlink has been licensed to provide internet services to Rwanda</li> <li>The Ministry of ICT and Innovation plans to pilot the internet services from Starlink's satellite technology in 500 Rwandan schools; the first 50 schools have already been provided Starlink internet</li> </ul>	The <b>New Times</b> February 2023 Starlink internet to be piloted in 500 schools

Note: 1) Prices based on online available information on residential subscription price (source: Starlink Insider) and these have not been verified for school connectivity Sources: Company websites, The New Times, Starlink Insider, Rwanda Space Agency, Interviews, Deloitte analysis

### Key takeaways Availability: LEO satellite internet has become available in Rwanda, and the government is collaborating with market players to make LEO satellite internet available for schools

Rwanda

Satellite

- + Affordability & Quality: first signals indicate that LEO satellite internet is competitive with other connectivity solutions
- Competition: Starlink currently is the only company offering LEO satellite services





# Rwanda | Enabling environment

The government is focused on improving prices in the telecommunications market and encourage foreign direct investment into the Rwanda economy



- The Government of Rwanda is aiming to improve competition among internet service providers to lower the costs for Rwandans. One such initiative is the establishment of the Rwanda Internet Exchange Point (RIXP), which allows local ISPs to exchange internet traffic within the country, rather than routing it through international networks
- Taxes and regulatory fees also play a role in determining internet prices in Rwanda. ISPs are subject to various taxes and levies, including a value-added tax (VAT) of 18% on internet services, as well as regulatory fees imposed by the Rwanda Utilities Regulatory Authority (RURA). These costs are often passed on to consumers in the form of higher prices for internet access
- The Ministry of ICT (MINICT) addresses national priorities relating to economic growth and poverty reduction through policies and programs related to information, technology, communication and innovation as well as citizen's empowerment





- **Foreign Direct Investments** (FDI) have been **on the rise** after a moderate dip during the COVID-19 pandemic and exceeding the investments from before the pandemic. The **FDI** in **2022** stood at around **400 million USD**, coming from 150 million USD in 2020.
- The **Rwandan Investment Code** calls for **equal treatment** for both **foreigners and nationals** in certain operations, free transfer of funds, and compensation in cases of expropriation. This makes Rwanda an **interesting economy** for **foreign investors and companies**

#### Access to finance indicators

- Exchange rate to USD: 0.00081
- **Overnment Debt to GDP (% of GDP): 67.5%** (2022)
- ) Interest rate: **7.5%** (2023)

Domestic Credit to private sector (% of GDP)<sup>2</sup>: **22.5%** (2022)

### Key takeaways

- Affordability: the establishment of the Rwanda Internet Exchange Point has helped to reduce the cost of internet and improve the overall quality of internet services in Rwanda
- Affordability: taxes and regulatory fees are passed onto consumers
- Funding security: there is a relatively high interest rate (7.5%), which may hamper investments

Notes: 1) The ITU ICT Regulatory Tracker distinguishes four generations in telecom regulation maturity: G1 – Command & control approach, G2 – Early open markets, G3 – Enabling investment & access, G4 – Integrated regulation; 2) Domestic Credit to Private Sector refers to the financial resources provided to the private sector (such as through loans or purchases of non-equity securities) that establish a claim for repayment (source: OECD) Sources: ITU, World Bank Development Indicators, Trading Economics, interviews, Deloitte analysis

# Nigeria | Broader context & status of school connectivity

IIII

<u>d</u>5

1010

ioio

In Nigeria, there is a lack of information on the connectivity of schools, but connectivity is expected to be relatively high in urban areas but low in rural areas

### Of all >110,000 schools, 80% of schools are covered by 3G/4G but actual connectivity is unknown<sup>1</sup>



#### Government support for school connectivity

- In March 2022, the Ministry of Education launched the Nigeria Learning Passport (NLP) together with UNICEF and Microsoft. The NLP offers digital learning resources and is supported by Airtel and IHS Towers to connect more
- schools and provide free access to the NLP on Airtel devices
- In March 2023, the government approved the budget of N24.2 billion (~\$31 million USD) to install broadband internet connections in 43 schools, 20 airports and 6 shopping malls

### Electricity

• In rural areas, access to electricity is major barrier



### **Digital literacy**

- Digital literacy is average in Nigeria; **55% of individuals** in Nigeria are using the internet
- Nigeria scores a 3.6 on the Wiley 'Digital Skills Gap Index', ranking 11<sup>th</sup> out of 26 countries in Sub-Saharan Africa

### Key takeaways

- Affordability: the government is making efforts to improve school connectivity and digital education, illustrated by the National Learning Passport (NLP) initiative
- Delivery: while in urban areas there is relatively high access to electricity (~89% of population), in rural areas there is a lack of access to electricity (only ~26% of population have access)
- Acceptability: there is a lack of digital skills with only 55% of individuals using the internet

Notes: 1) Status of school connectivity is unknown by Giga as Giga has not (yet) engaged with the government to obtain this data; 2) Gross national income at Purchasing Power Parity (PPP), with gross national income defined as the gross domestic product plus net receipts from abroad of compensation of employees, property income and net taxes less subsidies on production Sources: Giga, ITU, World Bank, GSMA, Wiley, Deloitte analysis

**giga** 2

# Nigeria | Fiber internet market

The fiber market in Nigeria is concentrated in the biggest city Lagos and the capital Abuja, and expanding to rural areas is considered not economic viable

### Key insights into the fiber internet market





#### **On-land fiber deployment 2022**





### Key takeaways

Fiber

Availability: investments in fiber in rural areas are considered too expensive, due to the low population density and high costs for maintenance

Nigeria

- + **Competition:** there are many ISPs (264), indicating low barriers to entry
- **Affordability:** Over the last 10 years, prices of fixed broadband relative to GNI per capita have barely reduced, indicating that affordability is a persistent challenge
- **Quality: fixed internet** seems to be relatively low compared to other countries in the region

Note: 1) Broadband prices as found in ITU's 'ICT prices dashboard', in which the yearly price for the cheapest offer by the market leader is compared with GNI per capita Sources: Giga, ITU, World Bank, Submarine Cable Networks, Nigeria Communications Commission (NCC) Annual Report 2022, Economic Confidential, ipNX, Ookla, Interviews, Deloitte analysis

# Nigeria | Wireless internet market

The mobile internet market in Nigeria is competitive and prices are relatively low, but most players lack economic incentive to expand their operations to rural areas

### Key insights into the wireless internet market





### Key takeaways Availability: there is a lack of economic incentive for MNOs to expand their mobile infrastructure to rural areas

Nigeria

Wireless

- Competition: There is a competitive mobile internet market in Nigeria with several large MNOs, and the recent introduction of MVNOs
- + Affordability: Prices of mobile broadband internet are relatively low in Nigeria compared to other countries
- + Quality seems to be relatively high compared to other countries in the region



# Nigeria | Satellite internet market

There is an active and competitive satellite internet market in Nigeria, and satellite internet is offered at an affordable price point

### Key insights into the satellite internet market

, ,			- 95577777777777777777777777777777777777
Coverage	<ul> <li>There is an active satellite market in Nigeria, and VSAT internet is being used across the country</li> <li>As of June 2023, Starlink Nigeria had a total customer base of 6,756 in Nigeria</li> <li>However, there are still several challenges for satellite internet in rural areas, including affordability, access to electricity, security, (digital) illiteracy and the provision of after-sales services</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Our coverage is as wide as you need it; if there is no fiber infrastructure and you don't have mobile network access at your location, we can service you with VSAT connectivity.</li> <li>ISP</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Key takeaways</li> <li>+ Competition: there is an active and competitive market for satellite connectivity in Nigeria</li> </ul>
Market players	<ul> <li>There are many players active in the satellite market of Nigeria, ranging from state-owned satellite operator NIGCOMSAT to satellite internet providers such as Yahclick, Avanti and Eutelsat</li> <li>Furthermore, there is the entrance of LEO-satellite players such as Starlink (which is available in Nigeria since January 2023 with Nigeria being the first African country to receive Starlink's service) and Eutelsat OneWeb</li> <li>Additionally, there are ISPs such as Coollink, Derive Communications and Tizeti which partner up with satellite internet providers to service their customers with satellite connectivity</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>We differentiate from our competitors by focusing on government enterprises.</li> <li>Furthermore, we have a network of resellers across the country and can deploy &amp; service customers in each state.</li> <li>Satellite operator</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Availability: besides various GEO satellite internet providers, LEO satellite internet is also available in Nigeria</li> <li>Affordability: satellite connectivity is at a competitive price point in Nigeria, with VSAT players offering satellite internet for as affordable as ~\$10 USD per month</li> </ul>
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>Starlink's LEO connectivity was introduced to the Nigerian market at \$48 USD per month with a one-off equipment &amp; shipping price of \$380 USD <sup>1</sup></li> <li>VSAT players such as Coollink on the other hand offer satellite internet as affordable as ~\$10 USD per month (20 Mbps) with an equipment price of ~\$80 USD</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>LEO satellite internet might be an option for private schools but at least for now is too expensive for public schools and GEO is preferred ISP</li> </ul>	
Market trends	<ul> <li>The Nigerian state-owned satellite operator NIGCOMSAT has recently partnered with Yahclick, to expand their GEO satellite footprint in Nigeria and beyond</li> <li>Nigerian ISP Tizeti and Eutelsat have partnered to provide GEO satellite internet to underserved areas through a public wi-fi hotspot service, particularly in remote areas that are difficult to reach by terrestrial broadband infrastructure.</li> </ul>	June 2023 NIGCOMSAT and YahClick to Enhance Broadband Connectivity in Sub- Saharan Africa Nov. 2022 Eutelsat, Tizeti partner to boost broadband penetration in Nigeria	

Note: 1) Prices based on online available information on residential subscription price (source: Business Insider Africa) and these have not been verified for school connectivity Sources: Business Insider Africa, Coollink, Space in Africa, Business Day, Interviews, Deloitte analysis

Satellite

Nigeria



# Nigeria | Enabling environment

There is significant commitment from the government to improve connectivity, but access to finance is a challenge, particularly for smaller players



G4

- In March 2020, Nigeria's National Broadband Plan (2020-2025) was launched with the aim to improve network coverage and quality. The target is to achieve download speeds of minimum 25 Mbps in urban areas and 10 Mbps in rural areas, with effective coverage available to >90% of population by 2025 at a price not more than 2% of median income / 1% of minimum wage
- MNOs who have reached a 5G license, are under the licensing requirements from the Nigeria Communications Commission (NCC) required to expand their coverage to reach at least two states in each of the country's six main regions within two years

The government is making efforts through the Nigeria Communications Commission (NCC). They specifically have a department for broadband penetration in the rural areas. They are making efforts, and we have been involved in government projects to reach the unreachable

Nigeria's telecom regulation maturity is classified by ITU's ICT Regulatory tracker as **Generation 4: 'integrated regulation**' <sup>1</sup>



- The interest rate in Nigeria is high (18.75%), which poses a challenge for capital-heavy investments such as developing new connectivity infrastructure
- Nigeria has a Universal Service Fund, but it is not considered to be successful up to now as limited funding has been provided
  - Access to finance for smaller players is a big issue as they cannot access development funding. A good example is Nigeria, where there are lots of local licenses, but none of the smaller players have been able to raise \$50-100 million to expand fiber in the region. - Infrastructure company

#### Access to finance indicators

- S) Exchange rate to USD: **0.00013** USD (2023)
- Government Debt to GDP (% of GDP): **38%** (2022)
- ) Interest rate: **18.75%** (2023)

Domestic Credit to private sector (% of GDP)<sup>2</sup>: **13.56%** (2021)

### Key takeaways

- Funding security: Nigeria has a well-established telecommunications market, and significant commitment from the government to improve the coverage and quality of internet
- Funding security: the high interest rate poses a challenge for capital-heavy investments such as connectivity infrastructure
- Funding security: smaller players in particular struggle to gain access to finance, as smaller players often cannot access development funding

Notes: 1) The ITU ICT Regulatory Tracker distinguishes four generations in telecom regulation maturity: G1 – Command & control approach, G2 – Early open markets, G3 – Enabling investment & access, G4 – Integrated regulation; 2) Domestic Credit to Private Sector refers to the financial resources provided to the private sector (such as through loans or purchases of non-equity securities) that establish a claim for repayment (source: OECD) Sources: ITU, World Bank Development Indicators, Trading Economics, S&P Global, OECD, Nigeria Communications Commission (NCC) Annual Report 2022, Interviews, Deloitte analysis

giga 3

33

# Sierra Leone | Broader context & status of school connectivity

In Sierra Leone, only 1.5% of schools are connected, the government is committed to increase connectivity in schools, but digital illiteracy and lack of electricity access create barriers



Notes: 1) Gross national income at Purchasing Power Parity (PPP), with gross national income defined as the gross domestic product plus net receipts from abroad of compensation of employees, property income and net taxes less subsidies on production; 2) Data on government expenditure on school connectivity has not been found, but the available government budget has been compared among the 9 focus countries by looking at GNI per capita and government expenditure on education as percentage of GDP Sources: Giga, BCG, GSMA, WorldBank, Leonecom, Sierraloaded, Deloitte analysis

# Sierra Leone | Fiber internet market

Affordability of fixed broadband connectivity is a major challenge in Sierra Leone; with the reliance on a single first-mile operator as a possible root cause for high prices

### Key insights into the fiber internet market

	• The Africa Coast to Europe (ACE) submarine cable lands in capital Freetown	35	Key takeaways
Coverage	<ul> <li>In August 2023, Huawei handed over the completed National Fiber Optic Backbone to operator Leonecom</li> <li>Although fiber coverage used to be low and usage still is (&lt;1%), the National Fiber Optic Backbone Project has recently been completed (August 2023), spanning 14 of the 16 districts and connecting all major towns and cities in Sierra Leone</li> </ul>	— Fiber backbone <sup>2</sup>	<ul> <li>Competition: there is a single first-mile operator which potentially leads to higher wholesale bandwidth prices</li> </ul>
Market players	<ul> <li>The access point of the ACE submarine cable (first-mile) is managed by ZoodLabs</li> <li>The National Fiber Optic Backbone is operated by Leonecom</li> <li>There are three Fixed Network Operators: Sierratel, Orange and Africell</li> <li>According to the latest registry of regulator NATCOM (2020), there were 17 Internet Service Providers (ISPs) active in Sierra Leone (+ the MNOs who also act as ISPs)</li> </ul>	Sierrate When have	+ Competition: Although the fiber market is small, there are 17 ISPs which suggests low barriers to entry
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>High price of fixed connectivity, which is priced at 38% of GNI per capita and on average \$5,56 USD per Mbps per month (3rd most expensive of the 9 focus countries)</li> <li>The ISP K3Tele offers an unlimited business internet connection for \$399 USD per month at 100 Mbps download speed</li> <li>According to the Ookla speedtest global index download speed is 14 Mbps and upload is 8 Mbps, which ranks the country 145<sup>th</sup> out of 181</li> </ul>	Broadband prices as % of GNI per capita <sup>1</sup> Fixed 60% 40% 20% 0% 2014 2016 2018 2020 2022	<ul> <li>Affordability: high price of fixed connectivity (~38% of GNI per capita)</li> <li>Quality: Relatively low quality of fixed broadband internet</li> </ul>
Market trends	<ul> <li>Africell received a USD 100 million grant from the United States Trade and Development Agency (USTDA) for a feasibility study to expand fixed broadband network in up to 32 cities and towns</li> </ul>	U.S. TRADE AND DEVELOPMENT AGENCY	

Notes: 1) Broadband prices as found in ITU's 'ICT prices dashboard', in which the yearly price for the cheapest offer by the market leader is compared with GNI per capita; 2) The coverage of the National Fiber Optic Backbone as retrieved from the Leonecom website

Sources: Giga, ITU, World Bank, Submarine Cable Networks, NATCOM Register of Licensed Telecom Operators in Sierra Leone (2020), NATCOM annual report (2019), Cable.co.uk, Interviews, Deloitte analysis

Sierra Leone

Fiber



The mobile market in Sierra Leone is dominated by two major operators; affordability however has significantly improved over the last years

### Key insights into the wireless internet market

			Key takeaways
Coverage	<ul> <li>Around 57% of schools are covered by a strong 3G or 4G network</li> <li>Sierra Leone aims for 80% 3G/4G coverage by 2024</li> <li>There are 98 mobile cellular subscriptions per 100 inhabitants</li> </ul>	• 3G/4G coverage	<ul> <li>Availability: 3G/4G network coverage is low for schools as only 57% of schools are covered</li> <li>Competition: there is limited competition in the mobile market as two providers dominate the market</li> <li>Affordability: Relatively low price of mobile connectivity (at 3% of GNI per capita, and average price of \$0.67 USD per GB)</li> </ul>
Market players	<ul> <li>There are four Mobile Network Operators: Orange, Africell, Qcell and Sierratel</li> <li>In the mobile market, Orange and Africell are the market leaders with 52% and 45% share respectively</li> <li>Sierratel's network used to be based on CDMA technology, but recently launched its 4G network</li> </ul>	Qcell Sierratel 1% 1% 1% 1% Africell 45% Share (2020) 52% Orange	
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>Affordability of mobile connectivity has significantly improved over the last years, with now a relatively low price of mobile connectivity (at 3% of GNI per capita, and average price of \$0.67 USD per GB)</li> <li>Orange offers 4G mobile Wi-Fi at 10 Mbps (300 GB): ~\$50 USD per month; Africell offers 4G mobile broadband at 10 Mbps (unlimited data): ~\$70 USD per month</li> <li>Providing connectivity in rural areas is considered a major challenge, given the difficult terrain (Sierra Leone is a mountainous country) resulting in high costs</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Sierra Leon is a mountainous country; this is one of the biggest showstoppers, especially for point-to-point microwave solutions</li> <li>MNO</li> </ul>	
Market trends	<ul> <li>Africell has received the country's first 5G spectrum in 2022</li> <li>Orange is trialing 5G service for its subscribers in Freetown</li> </ul>	africell Nov. 2022 Africell receives 5G spectrum in Sierra Leone	



Sierra Leone

Wireless

Satellite internet might provide a solution for the challenging terrain in Sierra Leone, but affordability is likely to be a challenge

### Key insights into the satellite internet market

	<ul> <li>In Sierra Leone both GEO/VSAT and LEO satellite internet is available</li> <li>Satellite internet offers the potential to reach remote areas without large</li> </ul>	Example Eutelsat satellite coverage	Key takeaways
Coverage	additional capital investments of extending the middle-mile network (fixed or mobile) and <b>can be used in mountains and forests</b> (under the condition that a <b>line of sight</b> with the satellite can be established for GEO satellite internet)		+ Availability: satellite internet can offer a viable alternative to fiber & mobile in mountainous areas of Sierra Leone
Market players	<ul> <li>A variety of providers, such as Vizocom, Globaltt and Ntvsat, offer GEO/VSAT internet in Sierra Leone</li> <li>Starlink has been granted a license and will initiate the LEO satellite internet market in Sierra Leone</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Satellite internet is very expensive – we have Eutelsat and the costs are way higher than other solutions</li> <li>- MNO</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Affordability: price of satellite internet (GEO and LEO) are considered high compared to other connectivity solutions</li> </ul>
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>Prices for GEO/VSAT satellite internet are estimated to range from ~\$40-\$150 USD per month <sup>1</sup></li> <li>Starlink has not announced prices for its services in Sierra Leone, but it is likely that they will be similar to prices in Nigeria which are approximately \$48 USD per month and \$380 USD for the equipment &amp; shipping</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>It depends on the costs – if the costs are okay then I'm sure we will do a partnership with Starlink.</li> <li>MNO</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>+ Availability: Starlink recently received an operating license in Sierra Leone</li> </ul>
Market trends	<ul> <li>In June 2023, Sierra Leone granted a license to Starlink; Sierra Leone is the fifth African country where Starlink will operate, after Nigeria, Mozambique, Rwanda and Mauritius</li> </ul>	African BUSINESS June 2023 Sierra Leone joins Elon Musk's Starlink satellite service	

Note: 1) Prices based on online available information on subscription price (source: TS2) and these have not been verified for school connectivity Sources: African Business, Company websites, TS2, Interviews, Deloitte analysis

Sierra Leone

Satellite
## Sierra Leone | Enabling environment

The government is supportive of increasing connectivity across the country; however, access to affordable finance is a major obstacle for further investments in connectivity



G2

- In June 2022, a new law was passed to govern the telecommunications industry in Sierra Leone: the National Communications Authority Act 2022. The act provides the regulatory and licensing framework for telecommunication operators
- Network operators require a **telecommunication service authorization (license)** from the NatCA
- Key requirements for network operators include **mandatory coverage targets, universal access and quality targets** (minimum data speed, transparency of the conditions of the service level agreement and equal access to services)

The challenge is the sustainability of connectivity after the government projects have ended. Funding is required to cover the recurring costs, but because of inadequate management decisions, there is no money collected from schools and funding stops.

Sierra Leone's telecom regulation maturity is classified by ITU's ICT Regulatory tracker as **Generation 2: 'early open markets**' <sup>1</sup>



- Interest rates in Sierra Leone are high (21%) compared to other countries, which is a problem for capital-heavy investments such as developing new connectivity infrastructure
- Along with other ECOWAS countries, Sierra Leone established a Universal Service Fund, the UADF to fund investments in ICT
  - Cost of equipment is a major cost component. In Sierra Leone, the economy has fallen drastically, and because of inflation the cost of goods has gone threefold. This has jeopardized the profitability of our contracts.

#### Access to finance indicators

- Exchange rate to USD: **0.000051** (2023)
- Government Debt to GDP (% of GDP): **98.8%** (2022)
- Interest rate: 21.3% (2023)



#### **Key takeaways**

- Delivery: high inflation affects the profitability of operators and their ability to meet contracts
- Affordability: lack of longterm funding that is available for school connectivity and to cover the recurring costs
- Funding security: high cost of capital due to high interest rates

Notes: 1) The ITU ICT Regulatory Tracker distinguishes four generations in telecom regulation maturity: G1 – Command & control approach, G2 – Early open markets, G3 – Enabling investment & access, G4 – Integrated regulation; 2) Domestic Credit to Private Sector refers to the financial resources provided to the private sector (such as through loans or purchases of non-equity securities) that establish a claim for repayment (source: OECD) Sources: ITU, World Bank Development Indicators, Trading Economics, Interviews, Deloitte analysis

# Benin | Broader context & status of school connectivity

In Benin, there is a lack of information on the connectivity of schools, but connectivity is expected to be low due to challenges of affordability, electricity and digital literacy



Notes: 1) Gross national income at Purchasing Power Parity (PPP), with gross national income defined as the gross domestic product plus net receipts from abroad of compensation of employees, property income and net taxes less subsidies on production; 2) Data on government expenditure on school connectivity has not been found, but the available government budget has been compared among the 9 focus countries by looking at GNI per capita and government expenditure on education as percentage of GDP; 3) The Wiley 'Digital Skills Gap Index' measures a country's digital development in terms of digital skills on 6 pillars (e.g. digital skills institutions, government support for bridging the digital skills gap); Sources: Giga, ITU, World Bank, GSMA, Wiley, Deloitte analysis

**giga** 38

### Benin | Fiber internet market

State-owned company SBIN is the only fiber provider in Benin, and while fiber broadband could be a viable solution for urban areas, affordability is a challenge

#### Key insights into the fiber internet market

Coverage	<ul> <li>There are three submarine cables entering Benin in Cotonou: the SAT-3/WASC, ACE and West Africa cables</li> <li>The fiber-optic backbone of Benin covers &gt;3,000 km and 86% of communes</li> <li>~50% of schools in Benin are located within 10 km to the closest fiber node</li> <li>The fixed market represents ~6% of the total telecommunications market (incl. telephone), and there are &lt;1 fixed broadband subscriptions per 100 inhabitants</li> </ul>	Fiber backbone
Market players	<ul> <li>There is one fixed network operator: state-owned company SBIN. SBIN manages the fiber-optic backbone and deploys fixed LTE and Fiber-to-the-Home</li> <li>Besides SBIN, there is one other ISP that offers fiber: Isocel. Isocel is however only active in the Cotonou area (south of Benin)</li> </ul>	<b>SBiN</b>
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>Fixed broadband prices are expensive relative to the gross national income (GNI) per capita (23%), which is an indicator for high connectivity prices for schools</li> <li>Fiber-to-the-Home from SBIN (through their Celtiis brand) and Isocel are priced between \$25 per month (10 Mbps down, 3 Mbps up, unlimited volume) and \$65 USD per month (50 Mbps down, 10-12 Mbps up, unlimited volume)</li> <li>The fixed broadband has a median download speed of 21 Mbps and an upload speed of 9 Mbps, which ranks the country 133<sup>rd</sup> out of 181</li> </ul>	Broadband prices as % of GNI per capita <sup>1</sup> 80% 60% 40% 20% 0% 2014 2016 2018 2020 2022
Market trends	<ul> <li>In October 2022, the Minister of Digital Transformation launched the Beninese Education and Research Network (RBER). The RBER connects 10 universities and academic centers through deployment of 7 km of fiber and 420 access points with an internet speed of 1000 Mbps</li> </ul>	Benin interconnects ten universities, more to come

Note: 1) Broadband prices as found in ITU's 'ICT prices dashboard', in which the yearly price for the cheapest offer by the market leader is compared with GNI per capita Sources: Giga, ITU, World Bank, Submarine Cable Networks, ARCEP Benin annual report 2022, Celtiis, We Are Tech Africa, Interviews, Deloitte analysis



Benin

Fiber

- Competition: the backbone is fully managed by state-owned company SBIN, which might result in increased wholesale prices if there is no substantial investment from the government
- Affordability: affordability of fiber connectivity is a challenge given fixed broadband is 23% of GNI per capita
- + Quality: Benin has the third highest quality of fixed internet of the nine focus countries



### Benin | Wireless internet market

The mobile internet market is dominated by MTN Benin and Moov Africa, but the government introduced Celtiis to the market (subsidiary of state-owned SBIN) to bring more competition

#### Key insights into the wireless internet market

	<ul> <li>93% of population in Benin is covered by mobile broadband network</li> <li>Around 84% of schools are covered by a strong 4G network</li> </ul>		Key takeaways
Coverage	<ul> <li>Around 24% of schools are covered by a strong 4d network</li> <li>There are 109 mobile cellular subscriptions per 100 inhabitants</li> <li>The coverage of the MNOs is concentrated in the densely populated south of Benin, but also covers the main towns &amp; roads towards the North; Moov Africa seems to have the largest geographical coverage</li> </ul>	• 3G/4G coverage	<ul> <li>Availability: the 4G</li> <li>network covers most of</li> <li>the population in Benin and</li> <li>84% of schools and market</li> </ul>
Market players	<ul> <li>There are three MNOs in Benin: Moov Africa, MTN Benin and Celtiis</li> <li>MTN is the market leader with a revenue market share of 68% (in 2022)</li> <li>Celtiis is a subsidiary of state-owned SBIN and was introduced to the market in 2022 to bring more competition in the mobile segment. Celtiis is managed by Sonatel (part of Orange) and offers fiber broadband and 4G LTE technologies</li> </ul>	Market share by revenue (2022) Celtiis Moov 32% 68% MTN	<ul> <li>players are investing into solutions for remote areas</li> <li>Competition: MTN is the dominant market player with a market share of 68%</li> <li>Competition: The entrance of Celtiis into the mobile market has brought more competition</li> <li>Availability: mobile and infrastructure players are partnering to provide mobile access using solar-powered towers in rural areas</li> <li>Affordability: mobile broadband is cheaper than fixed broadband but still at 6% of GNI per capita</li> </ul>
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>Price for mobile broadband is expensive with \$2.37 USD per GB of mobile data (most expensive of the 9 focus countries)</li> <li>Mobile broadband is priced at 6% of GNI per capita, which significantly exceeds Broadband Commission's target of 2% of GNI per capita</li> </ul>		
Market trends	<ul> <li>Ericsson and MTN announced a partnership to provide mobile broadband to remote rural areas that have limited or no connectivity. A total of 29 mobile towers will be deployed which will run on 100 percent solar and battery power</li> <li>As of January 2023, the telecom regulator ARCEP opened the 5G spectrum, granting mobile network operators the possibility to deploy experimental 5G networks. Since then, MTN Benin announced the launch of 5G</li> </ul>	July 2023         FRICSSON         Ericsson and MTN connect remote areas with solar power in Benin         June 2023         • Autorisation de l'expérimentation de la 5G au Bénin	



Wireless

Benin

### Benin | Satellite internet market

The satellite internet market seems to be at a nascent stage in Benin; Starlink has however recently entered the market to provide LEO satellite connectivity

#### **Eutelsat's Konnect Ka-band coverage** Key takeaways • **GEO/VSAT satellite** internet is **available** in Benin, but no information has been + Availability: there are found to what extent it is being deployed and used Coverage various (international) Starlink launched LEO satellite internet in Benin in November 2023 **GEO** satellite internet service providers, and Starlink has recently been launched in Benin We work with ISPs abroad to deliver satellite connectivity in Affordability: There are several international satellite ISPs such as BusinessCom, Vizocom and the region. We have provided Spacecom that offer GEO satellite services in Benin affordability of LEO Market players internet connectivity to a bank in satellite internet is • With the launch of Starlink the company is the first provider of LEO satellite internet Benin across its various sites. expected to be a - Nigerian satellite operator **challenge** given the higher price and low GNI per capita • With the **entrance of Starlink**, the country will have access to high-speed and low Pricing & latency satellite internet, with prices around \$55 USD per month and one-off quality equipment & shipping price of ~\$700 USD STARLINK November 2023 Starlink launched LEO satellite internet in Benin in November 2023 Market trends Starlink launches satellite broadband service in Benin

Key insights into the satellite internet market

Note: 1) Prices based on online available information on residential subscription price (source: Starlink Insider) and these have not been verified for school connectivity Sources: Company websites, Connecting Africa, Starlink Insider, GlobalTT, Commsupdate, TS2, Deloitte analysis

Satellite

Benin



# Benin | Enabling environment

The government is making efforts to decrease connectivity prices, for instance by imposing price controls and supporting the industry by attracting private investments



G2

- The telecommunications regulator ARCEP imposes price controls that prevent companies from overcharging customers, which is based on an analysis of service production costs and allowable profit margin. Although affordability remains a challenge, this regulation has led to lower prices in Benin and has eased access to internet
- Benin has also implemented a **Digital Code**, which prescribes the conditions for access, confidentiality and **neutrality** in the telecommunications industry
- The **taxation system** for the ICT sector underwent **simplification** through the implementation of the finance law. This law standardized the GSM communications fee at a fixed rate of 10% of the monthly turnover so that the operators can increase their investments and promote growth

Access to finance

- Interest rates in Benin are low compared to other ECOWAS countries, which is positive for capital-heavy investments such as developing new connectivity infrastructure
- Benin's government continues efforts to attract private investment and has raised EUR 1.5 billion on the Eurostox market and XOF 86 billion (USD 138 million) on the WAEMU financial market
- The Investment and Exports Promotion Agency works with foreign companies to facilitate new investments and brings down processing time for new business registrations and construction permits

### Access to finance indicators Exchange rate to USD: 0.0016 (2023) Government Debt to GDP (% of GDP): 53% (2022) Interest rate: 5.25% (2023) Domestic Credit to private sector (% of GDP)<sup>2</sup>: 17.1% (2021)

#### Key takeaways

- + **Affordability:** the government has imposed price controls on telecommunication operators
- + Funding security: the interest rate in Benin is **low** compared to other assessed countries (~5%), which is positive for high-**CAPEX investments** such as telecommunication infrastructure
- Funding security: the government continues efforts to attract (foreign) private investments into its economy

Benin's telecom regulation maturity is classified by ITU's ICT Regulatory tracker as Generation 2: 'early open markets' 1

Notes: 1) The ITU ICT Regulatory Tracker distinguishes four generations in telecom regulation maturity: G1 - Command & control approach, G2 - Early open markets, G3 - Enabling investment & access, G4 - Integrated regulation; 2) Domestic Credit to Private Sector refers to the financial resources provided to the private sector (such as through loans or purchases of non-equity securities) that establish a claim for repayment (source: OECD) Sources: ITU, World Bank Development Indicators, Worldbank, USA Buerau of Economic and Business Affairs, International Trade Administration, Trading Economics, S&P Global, OECD, University of Oxford, Interviews, Deloitte analysis



# South Africa | Broader context & status of school connectivity

School connectivity is relatively good in South Africa with around 80% of public schools being connected, but the stability of electricity and digital illiteracy form a barrier for further uptake





1010

1010

#### Government support for school connectivity

- In 2013, the South African government approved the SA Connect initiative, which aimed to connect 6,135 government facilities including schools
- The communications regulator, ICASA has mandated (through spectrum licenses) telecommunications companies to provide broadband services to 18,520 schools

#### Electricity

• Access to **stable** electricity supply is a **major barrier** 



#### **Digital literacy**

- Digital literacy is relatively high in South Africa; with **72% of individuals** in South Africa using the internet
- South Africa scores a 4.4 on the Wiley 'Digital Skills Gap Index', ranking 4<sup>th</sup> out of 26 countries in Sub-Saharan Africa

### Key takeaways

- Affordability: South African has the **most unequal** income equality in the world, with the poorest living of \$2.15 per day
- Affordability: dedicated initiatives from the government have been stymied by limited funding
- Delivery: stable electricity
   supply is a major challenge
   due to constraints
   experienced at the national
   electricity provider Eskom
- Acceptability: there is a gap of digital skills with 28% of individuals not using the internet

Notes: 1) Gross national income at Purchasing Power Parity (PPP), with gross national income defined as the gross domestic product plus net receipts from abroad of compensation of employees, property income and net taxes less subsidies on production; 2) Connectivity of schools as found through desk research (source: IOL (2023) 'Angie Motshekga says 80% of public schools have internet connectivity'); please note that this is not aligned with Giga's connectivity map, as data on connectivity per school is largely unavailable (blue colour) Sources: Giga, ITU, World Bank, GSMA, IOL, Wiley, Deloitte analysis



### South Africa | Fiber internet market

The fiber market is competitive in South Africa, and while fiber broadband could be a viable solution for urban areas, affordability is a challenge

#### Key insights into the fiber internet market

Coverage	<ul> <li>There are eight submarine cables entering South Africa: the SAT-3/WASC, SAFE, SAT-3/WASC, EASSy, METISS, Equiano, 2Africa and West Africa cables</li> <li>The fiber-optic backbone in South Africa is extensive, with over 100,000 km of cables deployed</li> <li>As of March 2023 South Africa has around 1.5 million households with fiber-to-the-home (FTTH) connectivity</li> <li>At the national level, about 90% of households do not have internet connection at home</li> </ul>	Fiber backbone
Market players	<ul> <li>The main fixed network operators: Vumatel, state co-owned company Openserve (Telkom), Metrofibre, Octotel, Frogfoot</li> <li>These fiber network operators (FNO's) own and manage their own fiber networks and provide wholesale access to other internet service providers (ISP's)</li> </ul>	VUMA open serve
Pricing	<ul> <li>Having largely frozen prices since the Covid-19 pandemic, FNOs such as Telkom's Openserve, Vumatel and Frogfoot have begun raising the fees they charge ISPs for accessing their networks to bring them in line with inflation</li> <li>Aggregate fixed internet prices are around \$17 USD per month (20 Mbps down, 14 Mbps up, unlimited volume), but government subsidies through the E-Rate Tariff offer a 50% discount for schools.</li> </ul>	20 Mbps Fiber prices of South African ISP's in USD 41 38 27 41 Jun <sup>rate</sup> Opensere N <sup>KN</sup> Fretoric
Market trends	<ul> <li>Vodacom e-learning equips educators with mobile technology to improve classroom experience. Educators and learners will be able to access content and lesson plans remotely</li> <li>Free internet for schools has partnered with Frogfoot, Vumatel and Octotel, offering fiber routers along with free data for school premises</li> </ul>	Mail Guardian April 2023 South Africa Investment Conference

Note: 1) Price per month based on retail prices from Orange and MTN for satellite internet and from MTN Benin and Moov for mobile internet Sources: Giga, ITU, BusinessDay, GSMA, MyBroadband, ICASA, Interviews, Deloitte analysis

# + Availability: the fiber-optic

Fiber

backbone covers over 100,000km

South Africa

- Competition: there are nine main FNO's that own and operate their own network, which contributes to healthy competition resulting in decreasing wholesale prices and increasing speeds
- Affordability: affordability of fiber connectivity is a challenge given the large low-income base in the country





### South Africa | Wireless internet market

Vodacom leads the mobile internet market with over 40% market share, while MTN has a denser network in the country

#### Key insights into the wireless internet market

-) -0		
Coverage	<ul> <li>National population coverage for 3G stood at 100% in South Africa, 4G/LTE stood at 98% and 5G stood at 20% in 2022.</li> <li>In 2022, 6,088 schools were connected to the internet based on universal service obligations imposed by ICASA.</li> <li>The South African mobile market supported approximately 180 mobile cellular subscriptions per 100 inhabitants, inflated by multiple SIMs and inactive SIMs.</li> <li>In 2021, 69.4% of households nationally had access to the internet using mobile devices. Rural households made up 59.2% nationally, accessing the internet through mobile devices in the same period.</li> </ul>	• 3G/4G coverage
Market players	<ul> <li>South Africa's market is competitive, with at least three strong mobile network operators and several mobile virtual network operators (MVNOs)</li> <li>Vodacom is the market leader with a market share of ~40%, followed by MTN with ~32%.</li> <li>Telkom, the largest operator in South Africa in terms of turnover and reach, is 51% government owned (including the Public Investment Corporations 12% shareholding).</li> </ul>	Telkom Market (2023) MTN
Pricing	<ul> <li>Price of prepaid mobile internet is <b>\$0.81-\$1.09 USD for 100MB</b> and, <b>\$33-\$38 USD for 20,480MB</b> (34.71 Mbps down, 6.79 Mbps up)</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>If you look at urban areas, there is no reason not to have connectivity</li> <li>MNO</li> </ul>
Market trends	<ul> <li>At present, 4G is heavily underutilised, leaving operators with plenty of opportunity to migrate subscribers over to these higher value plans, which should support growth</li> <li>The delayed spectrum auction in March 2022 raised over ZAR14.4bn (USD970.0mn) for ICASA (Independent Communication Authority of SA)</li> </ul>	South Africa Telecommunications Report

Sources: Giga, GSMA, World Bank, MyBroadband, CommsUpdate, BMI, ICASA, Deloitte analysis

#### Key takeaways

- Availability: the 4G network covers 98% of the population in South Africa, with 6,088 schools connected
- Competition: MTN and Vodacom are the dominant market players with a combined market share of over 70%
- **Competition**: The mobile market is **strongly concentrated** between MTN and Vodacom, while smaller players Cell C and Telkom have struggled to grow their market shares significantly



### South Africa | Satellite internet market

GEO satellite internet is available in South Africa but LEO/MEO satellite internet is at a nascent stage, and satellite internet is considered more expensive than other connectivity options

#### Key insights into the satellite internet market

Coverage	<ul> <li>GEO satellite internet is available in South Africa. For example, Eutelsat's satellite coverage is present across South Africa through 128 high-power spot beams, and YahClick by HughesNet has satellite coverage present in most of South Africa, except the North-West Province</li> <li>LEO/MEO Satellite internet is at a nascent stage in South Africa</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>LEO and MEO satellite solutions are great, but it is early days.</li> <li>There is not much regulations as well and there are political issues with having no ground stations in-country.</li> <li>Infrastructure provider</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Key takeaways</li> <li>Availability: for rural areas with no access to fiber or mobile connectivity, there are not a lot of</li> </ul>
Market players	<ul> <li>Eutelsat and HughesNet offer satellite Internet to home users in South Africa through several ISPs — including DSL Telecom Connect, MorClick, and Vox.</li> <li>The entry of Starlink in South Africa can boost satellite internet access in the country. However, the company has not obtained an operating license yet</li> </ul>	<b>Q</b> eutelsat HughesNet.	<ul> <li>options available, given that the LEO/MEO satellite internet market is still nascent</li> <li>Affordability: GEO/VSAT Satellite is comparatively more expensive than fixed broadband</li> </ul>
Pricing	<ul> <li>As satellite internet is comparatively more expensive than other internet solutions, it does not have any significant presence across schools in South Africa</li> <li>Eutelsat offers five different plans with speeds ranging from 5 to 50 Mbps</li> <li>Yahclick offers two different plans with speeds ranging from 10 to 20 Mbps</li> </ul>	Price of GEO satellite vs. Fiber \$37 Fiber (20Mbps) GEO Satellite (20Mbps)	<ul> <li>Quality: the available Mbps varies starts at 5 Mbps, which is sufficient for meaningful connection, however Satellite internet often has high latency</li> </ul>
Market trends	<ul> <li>HughesNet offers distance learning solutions and internet connectivity for schools across the world</li> <li>Internet Service Provider MorClick partnered with Yahclick, to provide free internet to 15 schools in South Africa for three months</li> </ul>	MYBROADBAND TRUSTED IN TECH March 2022 MorClick – Satellite internet that changes lives	



South Africa

Satellite



# South Africa | Enabling environment

Multiple regulatory policies are in force to enhance internet access and drive down prices across the country, many of which focus specifically on school connectivity



G4

- The Independent Communication Authority of South Africa, an autonomous regulatory body responsible for overseeing and regulating the communications sector in South Africa, established under the ICASA Act
- **E-rate tariff**, grants 50% discount on data usage to public schools, technical vocational education and training colleges. They are eligible to benefit from this E-rate tariff allowing them to access the internet at a reduced rate. Certain educational websites may avail zero-rated benefits from telecom providers, allowing the users to view or download content from those sites for free

To make universal school connectivity happen, there needs to be a major policy initiative from the state authorities who are responsible for education, whether provincial or national. This needs some serious resources to make this happen.

- Infrastructure provider 🄊

South Africa's telecom regulation maturity is classified by ITU's ICT Regulatory tracker as **Generation 4: 'integrated regulation**' <sup>1</sup>



- Interest rates in South Africa are low compared to other SADC countries, which is positive for capital-heavy investments such as developing new connectivity infrastructure;
- Universal Service and Access Obligations mandates telecom operators, to connect a designated number of schools to the internet including institutions for persons with disabilities, within a five-year period. This facilitates enhanced educational resources, online learning, and research opportunities

#### Access to finance indicators

- m Exchange rate to USD: **0.054** (2023)
- Government Debt to GDP (% of GDP): **75%** (2022)
- Interest rate: 8.25% (2023)



#### **Key takeaways**

- Affordability: the government has imposed price controls on telecommunication operators
- Funding security: the interest rate in South Africa is relatively high. The Central Bank has raised interest rates by a total of 475 basis points since November 2021, which is unfavorable for high-CAPEX investments such as telecommunication infrastructure

Notes: 1) The ITU ICT Regulatory Tracker distinguishes four generations in telecom regulation maturity: G1 – Command & control approach, G2 – Early open markets, G3 – Enabling investment & access, G4 – Integrated regulation; 2) Domestic Credit to Private Sector refers to the financial resources provided to the private sector (such as through loans or purchases of non-equity securities) that establish a claim for repayment (source: OECD Sources: ITU, World Bank Development Indicators, Trading Economics, S&P Global, OECD, University of Oxford, Interviews, Deloitte analysis

# Botswana | Broader context & status of school connectivity

Around 32% of schools in Botswana have meaningful connectivity; the sparse population as well as a lack of electricity are identified as barriers to connectivity



#### Government support for school connectivity

- In 2019 BOCRA launched the Schools Connectivity and Computerization Project, which funded provision of broadband internet connectivity and installation of computers of 69 schools in rural and remote villages
- SmartBots program by the government continuously aims to digitize the country and plans to connect 500 villages to the internet
- **SmartBots** and **Giga** work together to **connect schools** to higher speed internet, which has so far benefited 400 schools

#### Electricity

• In rural areas, access to electricity is major barrier

Total80%20%Urban93%7%Rural25%75%% of population with access to electricity

#### Digital literacy

1010

ioio

- Digital literacy is high in Botswana; **74% of individuals** in Nigeria are **using** the **internet**
- Botswana scores a 4.2 on the Wiley 'Digital Skills Gap Index', ranking 4<sup>th</sup> out of 26 countries in Sub-Saharan Africa

### Key takeaways

- Acceptability: Digital literacy is high, and a large share of the population uses the internet
- Delivery: in rural areas there is a lack of access to electricity and very low population density increases price and risks of disruption, maintenance & security needs
- + Affordability: there is clear commitment from the government to improve the internet connection of villages

Note: 1) Gross national income at Purchasing Power Parity (PPP), with gross national income defined as the gross domestic product plus net receipts from abroad of compensation of employees, property income and net taxes less subsidies on production

Sources: Giga, ITU, World Bank, GSMA, Wiley, BOCRA, Deloitte analysis

### Botswana | Fiber internet market

The fiber market in Botswana is concentrated amongst three big players; the network covers most towns, but transit charges for international bandwidth are significant

#### Key insights into the fiber internet market



Note: 1) Broadband prices as found in ITU's 'ICT prices dashboard', in which the yearly price for the cheapest offer by the market leader is compared with GNI per capita; Sources: BOCRA, USTDA, Worldbank, Ookla, ITU, Interviews, Deloitte Analysis

giga 4

Botswana

Fiber

### Botswana | Wireless internet market

The mobile internet market in Botswana is relatively competitive and affordability of mobile broadband is good

### Key insights into the wireless internet market

	<ul> <li>Botswana has strong mobile coverage, following a good backbone infrastructure</li> <li>90% of schools are in areas, which are covered by 3G or 4G Mobile internet</li> </ul>	School internet coverage No coverage 2G 3G/4G Data unvailable	Key takeaways
Coverage	<ul> <li>Overall, Botswana had 4.28 million cellular mobile connections, which is equivalent to 162% of the total population</li> </ul>	<mark>4%</mark> 90% <mark>3</mark> %	<ul> <li>Availability: limited availability in rural areas as the business case is low for</li> </ul>
Market players	<ul> <li>BTC, Orange and Mascom are also the main providers for mobile phone services</li> <li>As of November 2023 Orange has already launched 5G internet for its customers and BTC plans to follow suit with optimising its 4G/ 5G network</li> <li>There are at least 10 internet service providers in Botswana</li> </ul>	Market share mobile internet BTC 18% 39% Mascom Orange	<ul> <li>connecting rural tows</li> <li>&lt;5000 inhabitants</li> <li>+ Affordability: mobile broadband is affordable compared to the GNI per capita</li> <li>+ Quality: mobile internet connection speed is faster than fixed internet</li> </ul>
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>The price of mobile subscriptions is below the 2% of GNI per capita target set by the Broadband Commission for the past few years</li> <li>Mobile broadband costs \$1.99 USD per GB</li> <li>Connecting smaller villages (&lt;500 inhabitants) to high-speed internet is considered not economically viable (no viable business case)</li> <li>According to Ookla's Speedtest Global Index, the median mobile internet connection speed is 33 Mbps, which is more than four times faster than median fixed internet speed</li> </ul>	Broadband prices as % of GNI per capita1 15% Mobile 5% 1.0% 0% 2014 _ 2016 _ 2018 _ 2020 _ 2022	
Market trends	• <b>Orange</b> Botswana has <b>launched</b> the group's <b>first 5G network in Africa</b> . The new infrastructure covers 30% of the country's population, centered on greater Gaborone and Francistown, with other cities to follow in 2023. Despite these upgrades, the focus seems to remain on bigger cities, not including more rural areas of Botswana	COMMENSION November 2022 Orange Botswana launches the group's first African 5G network	

Note: 1) Broadband prices as found in ITU's 'ICT prices dashboard', in which the yearly price for the cheapest offer by the market leader is compared with GNI per capita Sources: Giga, BOCRA, Reuters, Ookla, CommsUpdate, Interviews, Deloitte analysis



There is a competitive satellite internet market in Botswana, but quality of the offered GEO satellite internet is relatively low

#### Key insights into the satellite internet market

Coverage	<ul> <li>The country has full <b>GEO satellite coverage</b> available via BTC VSAT Hub and Ku Band satellites</li> <li>Satellite internet is <b>available everywhere</b> in the country</li> </ul>	Bit Satellite Coverage	<ul> <li>Key takeaways</li> <li>+ Competition: there are several providers of GEO satellite internet</li> </ul>
Market players	<ul> <li>According to BOCRA, there are several players offering satellite internet connections, for example, Lenong Communications, Zebranet, GCSAT and BTC, among others</li> <li>BTC targets remote areas, businesses and schools directly and has recently bought more capacity on the AMOS-7 satellite from Spacecom to improve its offer for rural customers</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>The population distribution is a challenge – some villages are 100s of kilometers away from the nearest fiber node</li> <li>Infrastructure provider</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Availability: GEO satellite internet is available, and LEO internet is expected to become available soon</li> <li>Quality: quality of GEO satellite internet is relatively low and offered</li> </ul>
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>Price of GEO internet is relatively high (e.g. ranging from \$35 per month for 0.5 Mbps to \$525 per month for 10 Mbps at GCSat, and starting at ~\$60 per month at BTC) <sup>1</sup></li> <li>Starlink is planning to provide LEO satellite internet for \$48 USD per month (for 150 Mbps internet) <sup>1</sup>, which would make a relatively cheap &amp; high-quality option</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>The lifespan of telecom equipment is 7-10 years or 15 years if you push it, for 500 people it does not make economically sense</li> <li>Infrastructure provider</li> </ul>	<b>relatively low</b> and offered speed is often too slow for a meaningful internet connection
Market trends	<ul> <li>According to Starlink's website, the satellite internet service planned to launch in Botswana in Q3 2023. This has now been adjusted to Q3 2024 since, according to the Botswana Communications &amp; Regulatory Authority (BOCRA), the company is yet to get the licensing requirements needed to set up operations in Botswana.</li> </ul>	September 2023 Starlink Has Not Received License To Operate In Botswana, Says BOCRA	

Note: 1) Prices based on online available information (source: BOCRA for GEO/VSAT and Guardian Sun for Starlink) and these have not been verified for school connectivity Sources: BOCRA, Guardian Sun, Amos-Spacecom, Interviews, Deloitte analysis



Botswana

Satellite

**BTC** satellite coverage

### Botswana | Enabling environment

There is significant commitment from the government to improve connectivity



- In 2019, the Botswana Communications Regulatory Authority (BOCRA) engaged with operators and agreed to cut data prices by up to 46 % making data prices competitive in the region
- Botswana Fiber Network (BoFiNet), the state-owned entity that provides wholesale national and international telecommunication infrastructure and services to the Botswana Telecommunications Corporation (BTC) offered service providers Indefeasible Right of Use (IRU) contracts for connectivity, reducing prices in some cases to below
   \$0.86 per Megabits per second (Mbps)

In Botswana, connectivity has been designated as a basic amenity by the government, resulting in it being a requirement for all villages with a population of over 500 people

- Infrastructure provider 🎐





- Botswana's financial system appears to be mostly stable, sound and resilient to a wider range of shocks relating to risks such as volatility in diamond prices, geo-political development and the tightening of global financial conditions
- The Botswana Pula, is the **strongest currencies in Southern Africa**, which **benefits** the **economic growth** of the country

Infrastructure providers have very small margins, and all equipment is procured from outside the continent.

- Infrastructure provider

#### Key takeaways

- Funding security: The government provides funding for connectivity and digitization of local government premises, which includes schools
- Funding security: Botswana has a stable and relatively strong economy, which facilitates investments

Exchange rate to USD: **0.073** 

Government Debt to GDP (% of GDP): **26.1%** (2022)

Interest rate: 2.65% (2023)

Access to finance indicators

Domestic Credit to private sector (% of GDP)<sup>2</sup>: **29.76%** (2021)

Notes: 1) The ITU ICT Regulatory Tracker distinguishes four generations in telecom regulation maturity: G1 – Command & control approach, G2 – Early open markets, G3 – Enabling investment & access, G4 – Integrated regulation; 2) Domestic Credit to Private Sector refers to the financial resources provided to the private sector (such as through loans or purchases of non-equity securities) that establish a claim for repayment (source: OECD) Sources: ITU, Trading Economics, XE, International Monetary Fund, Interviews, Deloitte analysis



# Malawi | Broader context & status of school connectivity

1010

ioio

In Malawi, only 1.5% of schools are connected to the internet, although 43% of schools are covered by a good-quality network



#### **Government support for school connectivity**

- However, the government is committed to digitalizing education as outlined in its Malawi 2063 strategy; through the 'Connect-A-School' initiative, Malawi aims to connect all schools by 2030
- The Connect-A-School initiative is supported with funding by Malawi's Universal Service Fund as well as a recent partnership of UNICEF and Airtel Malawi

#### **Electricity**

• In rural areas, access to electricity is major barrier



#### **Digital literacy**

- Digital literacy is low in Malawi; 24% of individuals in Malawi are using the internet
- Malawi scores a 2.2 on the Wiley 'Digital Skills Gap Index', ranking 21st out of 26 countries in Sub-Saharan Africa

### Key takeaways

- Acceptability: Low uptake of internet in communities, due to **digital illiteracy**
- **Delivery:** while in urban areas there is some access to electricity, **in rural areas** there is almost no access to electricity
- Funding security: the government is committed to connect every school by 2030 to the internet, illustrated by the Connect-A-School initiative
- Availability: lack of business viability for expanding due to lack of general road infrastructure, low population density and low ability to pay

Note: 1) Gross national income at Purchasing Power Parity (PPP), with gross national income defined as the gross domestic product plus net receipts from abroad of compensation of employees, property income and net taxes less subsidies on production

Sources: Giga, ITU, World Bank, Wiley, Deloitte analysis

# Malawi | Fiber internet market

The national fiber backbone in Malawi is gradually expanding, and competition has increased, but affordability remains a major challenge

#### Key insights into the fiber internet market

Coverage	<ul> <li>Malawi is connected to the national telecom networks of Tanzania. Through Tanzania and its neighbouring countries, Malawi has created multiple optic fiber gateways to the landing stations of the SEACOM and EASSy sea cables</li> <li>Malawi has a national fiber backbone connecting al 28 districts in the country. The first phase covered over 1.300 km of fiber. The second phase, which is currently deployed, will cover an additional 1.500 km</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Fixed Wireless Access shoots far, it is a technology that is now mature in the market. In Kenya, Poa! Internet is using it to service remote areas.</li> <li>Infrastructure provider 29</li> </ul>
Market players	<ul> <li>Open Connect Limited (as 100% subsidiary of MTL) used to have a monopoly on the optic fiber backbone, but <b>new backbone operators have entered</b> the market, including inqDigital, Globe, and SimbaNet</li> <li>This has <b>stimulated additional connections</b> to <b>different undersea fiber networks</b> in neighboring countries and therefore <b>lower connectivity prices</b> for consumers</li> </ul>	Market share fiber internet Other Globe 18% 23% MTL 5% inqDigital
		Describer during a grad of the second
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>The price for a fixed broadband is 64% of the GNI per capita and has not improved in the past year</li> <li>Despite international gateways broadband capacity remains low and as a result the wholesale price for bandwidth is high</li> <li>Ookla's Speedtest Global Index indicates that Malawi has a download speed of 14 Mbps, which ranks it 146<sup>th</sup> out of 181 countries</li> </ul>	Broadband prices as % of GNI per capital <sup>1</sup> Fixed 150 100 50 0 2014 2018 2022

Note: 1) Broadband prices as found in ITU's 'ICT prices dashboard', in which the yearly price for the cheapest offer by the market leader is compared with GNI per capita Sources: Giga, ITU, World Bank, Ookla, Interviews, Deloitte analysis

### Key takeaways

Fiber

+ Competition: new operators have entered the middle-mile fiber market, which has increased competition

Malawi

- + **Competition:** backbone operators provide an **open access network** which enables competition among ISPs
- Affordability: high prices for fixed bandwidth because the country is landlocked, has limited bandwidth usage and lacks adequate long-term agreements
- Quality: average speed of the fixed internet is low





**Key takeaways** 

prices high

price

 Availability: most of the country is covered, but 4G is mainly in urban areas

**Competition: Duopoly** in mobile broadband market, can result in **limited competition** and keep

Affordability: high taxes are imposed on **devices**, which is reflected in the

# Malawi | Wireless internet market

The mobile internet market in Malawi is dominated by two major players; affordability is a major challenge

### Key insights into the wireless internet market

Coverage	<ul> <li>Most of the country is covered in 2G or 3G mobile network and 4G covers mostly urban areas</li> <li>At the beginning of 2022 the mobile penetration rate was 61%, which is still behind the average penetration rate of 66% in SADC</li> <li>20% of the population in Malawi has access to the internet</li> </ul>	% of population covered (2022)           2G         88%           3G         86%           4G         70%
Market players	<ul> <li>The two major mobile network operators are Airtel Malawi and Telekom Networks Malawi (TNM)</li> <li>TNM is the biggest operator and is currently the only operator that provides 5G and also holds two licenses for fixed network services</li> <li>A third mobile network operator, Malcel, received an operating licenses in 2022 and the operator is planning to go live in October 2023</li> </ul>	Market share (2023)
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>There are currently high taxes on devices (17.5%)</li> <li>Prices for mobile connectivity are lower than for fiber, but still is at 9% of GNI per capita (which is significantly above Broadband Commission's 2% target)</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>The biggest challenge for creating meaningful internet connectivity is the availability of smartphones - MNO</li> </ul>
Market trends	<ul> <li>Earlier in 2023 Telkom Networks Malawi (TNM) has started a pilot for 5G internet, following approval from the Malawi Communications Regulatory Authority (MACRA). The 5G base stations are based in Blantyre and Lilongwe. Additional sites will be added in Mzuzu and Zomba. TNM has partnered with Huawei for the rollout of its 5G pilot</li> </ul>	Telekom Networks Malawi pilots 5G



55

# Malawi | Satellite internet market

The satellite market in Malawi seems to be nascent, but Starlink's entrance into the market could provide a new connectivity solution for rural areas

#### Key insights into the satellite internet market

Coverage	• The country is <b>covered by GEO and LEO/VSAT satellites</b> that can provide internet to people in Malawi	<ul> <li>Satellite internet is developing and would be the ideal technology. [] I see that as the future.</li> </ul>	Key takeaways <ul> <li>Competition: limited <ul> <li>number of satellite</li> <li>internet providers could</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
Market players	<ul> <li>GEO/VSAT satellite internet is provided by the ISP Vizocom and by Liquid Technologies</li> <li>Since Starlink launched in August 2023, the country has access to LEO satellite internet as well</li> </ul>		<ul> <li>+ Availability: LEO satellite can offer new connectivity solutions for rural areas</li> </ul>
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>GEO internet provided by Vizocom and Liquid Technologies, but the prices for those services are not readily available</li> <li>The price of Starlink's LEO satellite internet is \$49 USD per month with a one-off equipment &amp; shipping price of ~\$550 USD <sup>1</sup></li> <li>Starlink promises that the internet speed is high and with low-latency and short maintenance periods</li> </ul>	Starlink is selling at ~\$700 at one-off cost and then \$50 dollar per month. That could work for rural areas - MNO	<ul> <li>Affordability: satellite internet tends to sit at a higher price point, but offers an alternative for connectivity solutions with high CAPEX (e.g. fiber)</li> </ul>
Market trends	<ul> <li>At the end of 2022 Starlink was granted a license to operate satellite broadband services in Malawi from MACRA. Starlink became the first licensed high-speed, low-latency broadband satellite service in the country</li> <li>Liquid Telecom provides VSAT connectivity services to mbora, a social FinTech enterprise in Malawi, through community hubs. Each hub is serviced with broadband speed of up to 36 Mbps. Liquid Telecom is using satellites of its long- term partner Intelsat and providing an uncapped data service to mbora</li> </ul>	August 2023 Musk's Starlink launches in Malawi The August 2023 July 2020 Liquid Telecoms Expands Reach to Rural Communities in Malawi	

Note: 1) Prices based on online available information (source: Connecting Africa) and these have not been verified for school connectivity Sources: IT Web, IT News Africa, Connecting Africa, Company websites, Interviews, Deloitte analysis



Malawi

Satellite



## Malawi | Enabling environment

The government has just set up the Universal Service Fund which may boost network coverage in rural areas, but access to finance remains a challenge



G4

- Malawi recently adopted the convergence licensing framework that focuses on technological neutrality of communication services in the country. With this framework in place, operators are not constrained by the technology they deploy to offer these services.
- MACRA plans to construct 75 ICT labs in collaboration with Ministry of Education across the country. Currently, only 241 out of 1,610 secondary schools offer computer studies due to the lack of technological and physical infrastructure. Macra, through the Universal Service Fund, will construct 100 ICT Labs annually for the next five years under Phase 1 of the ministry's 'Connect-a-School Project.

The government and regulator set up a Universal Service Fund where all operators bid to take the network in the rural areas. The fund will help subsidize these projects. The first tenders have just been issued and we are in the midst of preparing for that.

Malawi's telecom regulation maturity is classified by ITU's ICT Regulatory tracker as **Generation 4: 'integrated regulation**' <sup>1</sup>



- The interest rate is high, which means that the cost of capital is very high for potential investors
- The local currency is weak in comparison to the USD, which makes importing of raw materials, equipment and license fees (which have to be paid in USD) very expensive for market players
  - 6 The government will not have funding every year, so doing an IRIU (Indispensable Right of Use) model is an opportunity. We sell it for five or ten years and get paid in advance for that time period.

- Infrastructure provider

#### Access to finance indicators

- 5 Exchange rate to USD: 0.00088
- Government Debt to GDP (% of GDP): 67% (2022)
- ) Interest rate: **24%** (2023)

Domestic Credit to private sector (% of GDP)<sup>2</sup>: **10%** (2016)

#### Key takeaways

- Affordability: suppliers experience high costs, due to exchange rates, taxes and duties, which increases the prices of connectivity for end-users
- Funding security: the government set up a Universal Service Fund (USF) and issued tenders for increasing the connectivity in rural areas
- Funding security: the high interest rate makes capital investments expensive
- Funding security: the government budget for connectivity fluctuates from year to year

Notes: 1) The ITU ICT Regulatory Tracker distinguishes four generations in telecom regulation maturity: G1 – Command & control approach, G2 – Early open markets, G3 – Enabling investment & access, G4 – Integrated regulation; 2) Domestic Credit to Private Sector refers to the financial resources provided to the private sector (such as through loans or purchases of non-equity securities) that establish a claim for repayment (source: OECD) Sources: ITU, World Bank Development Indicators, Trading Economics, Interviews, Deloitte analysis

# Zimbabwe | Broader context & status of school connectivity

IIII

1010 1010

In Zimbabwe, ~28% of schools are connected to the internet; but all these schools have internet with speeds of less than 5 Mbps

### Around 76% of schools in Zimbabwe are covered by mobile broadband, but less than a third are connected to the internet Overview Population: 15 million Pop. density: 43 inhab. / km<sup>2</sup> Urban/rural split: 32%/68% • GNI/capita: \$1,500 GNI/capita (PPP1): \$2,460 No connectivity 2G School 72.2% 27.7% connectivity

#### **Government support for school connectivity**

- Telecom operators in Zimbabwe are obligated to allocate 1.5% of their annual turnover to the Universal Service Fund (USF). This fund is managed by POTRAZ to offer free internet facility in rural schools. As of 2021, over 400 schools have benefitted from free internet through the USF fund
- Broadband plan, adopted by Zimbabwean government for the period of 2023 – 2030, aims to reduce internet costs to 2% of average monthly income. The initiative aims to encourage schools to integrate technology into teaching methods, promote ICT education and digital literacy

#### **Electricity**

• In rural areas, access to electricity is major barrier



#### **Digital literacy**

- Digital literacy is low in Zimbabwe; **35% of individuals** in Zimbabwe are using the internet
- Zimbabwe scores a 2.8 on the Wiley 'Digital Skills Gap Index', ranking 15th out of 26 countries in Sub-Saharan Africa

### **Key takeaways**

- Acceptability: low digital **literacy** and internet usage limits the uptake of connectivity
- Availability: the low population density diminishes the business viability and profitability for internet in rural areas
- Delivery: overall lack of electricity with 51% of the population having no access to electricity
- **Quality**: 28% of schools are connected to the internet; but all these schools have low-speed internet (<5 Mbps)

Note: 1) Gross national income at Purchasing Power Parity (PPP), with gross national income defined as the gross domestic product plus net receipts from abroad of compensation of employees, property income and net taxes less subsidies on production

Sources: Giga, World Bank, Wiley, Deloitte analysis

# Zimbabwe | Fiber internet market

The fiber internet market in Zimbabwe is shaped by two major players; coverage of the fiber network is expanding throughout the country

#### Key insights into the fiber internet market

Coverage	<ul> <li>Zimbabwe's National Broadband Backbone (NBB) brings international broadband to Zimbabwe and interconnects major cities and towns across the country</li> <li>The backbone was built by the Posts and Telecommunications Corporation of Zimbabwe (PTC), which was commercialized in 2000 into three companies</li> <li>The population with a fixed internet connection is below 2%</li> </ul>	Fiber backbone	<ul> <li>Key takeau</li> <li>Competition</li> <li>Competition</li> <li>Competition</li> </ul>
Market players	<ul> <li>TelOne and Zol Zimbabwe (part of Liquid Home) are the largest fixed internet providers in Zimbabwe.</li> <li>Apart from TelOne, Dark Fibre Africa (a subsidiary of Vodacom) was granted a license to operate as an open-access-connectivity provider in Zimbabwe</li> <li>Zimbabwe has a several ISPs including TelOne, Zimbabwe Online (ZOL), Liquid (a subsidiary from Econet Wireless), Africom and PowerTel. Most (smaller) ISPs buy their bandwidth from TelOne</li> </ul>	Equipped International Internet Bandwidth Capacity (2023) TelOne 29% 1% 1% Dandemutande Powertel	<ul> <li>players in which can prices</li> <li>Affordabi fixed broa significan of GNI pe set by the Commission</li> </ul>
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>Price of fixed broadband is at 9% of GNI per capita; although more affordable than mobile broadband, it is still significantly above Broadband Commission's target of 2% of GNI per capita</li> <li>The average price for 100GB of fixed internet is \$85 USD per month with a speed of 3 – 15 Mbps</li> <li>Zimbabwe ranks 165<sup>th</sup> out of 181 countries in terms of quality of fixed broadband in Ookla's Speedtest Global Index (2<sup>nd</sup> lowest rank of 9 focus countries)</li> </ul>	Broadband prices as % of GNI per capita1 150% 100% 50% 0% 2014 2016 2018 2020 2022	<ul> <li>Quality: o broadban Zimbabwe</li> <li>Availabili players ar infrastrue</li> </ul>
Market trends	<ul> <li>In January 2023, Vodacom-owned Dark Fibre Africa announced plans to use Zimbabwe's major rail network to lay 2,000km of fiber across the country. The project has laid down 1,180km of fiber in its first phase</li> </ul>	<b>DFA</b> and BCS progress on long-haul fibre project along Zimbabwe's rail tracks	increases connectivi

Note: 1) Broadband prices as found in ITU's 'ICT prices dashboard', in which the yearly price for the cheapest offer by the market leader is compared with GNI per capita Sources: Postal and Telecommunications Regulatory Authority of Zimbabwe (POTRAZ), Ookla, African Wireless, Interviews, Deloitte analysis



Fiber

 Affordability: price for fixed broadband is significantly above the 2% of GNI per capita target set by the Broadband Commission

Zimbabwe

- Quality: quality of fixed broadband is low in Zimbabwe
- Availability: market players are investing in infrastructure, which increases coverage and connectivity,





# Zimbabwe | Wireless internet market

The mobile internet market in Zimbabwe is dominated by one player and affordability is a major challenge

### Key insights into the wireless internet market

	• Roughly 84% of the country is covered by mobile broadband (3G and/or 4G)	School coverage	Key takeaways
<ul> <li>76% of the schools are covered by mobile broadband connection, but only 53% receive coverage that is fast enough for meaningful internet connectivity</li> <li>In 2022 Econet Wireless has deployed 22 base stations in Harare for 5G connectivity</li> </ul>	53%         23%         24%           No coverage         2G         3G/4G	<ul> <li>Availability: in rural areas, coverage is limited</li> </ul>	
Market players	<ul> <li>There are three Mobile Network Operators; NetOne (one of the other companies founded after the commercialization of the PTC), Telecel Zimbabwe, and Econet Wireless Zimbabwe</li> <li>Each MNO has their own base stations, providing different levels of coverage across Zimbabwe</li> <li>Econet is currently the only mobile network operator with 5G infrastructure</li> <li>The spectrum that is available for mobile service providers by the government is limited and companies do not to sell their unused spectrum</li> </ul>	Mobile internet subscriptions (2022) Telecel 25% Econet	<ul> <li>Competition: low level of competition and dominance of one market player</li> <li>Competition: there is limited spectrum available, creating barriers for new entrants or community networks</li> <li>Affordability: high prices of mobile connectivity (at 18% of GNI per capita)</li> </ul>
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>Price of data-only mobile broadband is at 18% of GNI per capita, being the least affordable out of all 9 focus countries</li> <li>The average retail price for 50 GB of mobile internet sits at \$38 USD at a download speed between 2 – 8 Mbps</li> <li>Prices for handheld devices start at \$80 USD</li> </ul>	The cheapest handset is currently \$80 USD, which is out of reach for communities - MNO	
Market trends	<ul> <li>POTRAZ has granted Dolphin Telecoms the first mobile virtual network operator (MVNO) license. This means Dolphin Telecoms will compete with Econet, Telecel and NetOne as a mobile service operator without having their own base stations</li> <li>Dolphin telecom specializes in capacity wholesale and internet bandwidth for other ISPs</li> </ul>	Connecting March 2022 Dolphin Telecoms gets MVNO license in Zimbabwe	



**Key takeaways** 

in rural areas

+ **Competition:** there is a market for satellite connectivity in Zimbabwe with **several players** 

+ Availability: GEO satellite internet providers, that focus on providing internet

 Availability: LEO satellite internet is not available in Zimbabwe as of 2023

 Affordability: GEO satellite internet in Zimbabwe is considered not affordable due to the high monthly

subscription and installation price

Example Eutelsat satellite coverage

# Zimbabwe | Satellite internet market

The market for satellite internet is growing, but affordability of GEO satellite internet is a barrier

#### Key insights into the satellite internet market

Coverage	<ul> <li>VSAT/ GEO internet satellite connections are available everywhere in Zimbabwe</li> <li>LEO satellites are not available, but as the government is considering Starlink's application this might change in 2024</li> </ul>	Example Eutersat satellite coverage
Market players	<ul> <li>Most major ISPs offer VSAT internet to schools in rural areas</li> <li>TelOne, ZOL (Liquid Home), and Utande are the main VSAT internet providers</li> <li>TelOne has created a strong presence in Zimbabwe's VSAT internet market by leveraging Eutelsat and Avanti satellites</li> <li>The second largest provider ZOL offers discounted broadband connectivity to a few selected schools in Zimbabwe</li> <li>Utande is still expanding its operations but offers faster speed than the other two market players</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Starlink might be too expensive as of now, but it could help school connectivity and perhaps there are ways to bring down the price</li> <li>MNO</li> </ul>
Pricing & quality	<ul> <li>GEO satellite internet price ranges from \$180 USD to \$300 USD per month and download speed varies from 5 to 25 Mbps</li> <li>Initial installation prices of GEO satellite internet are approx. ~\$1,500 USD</li> </ul>	TelOne VSAT offer www.www.www.www.www.www.www. Achieve Better Crop Quality and Yield
Market trends	<ul> <li>Zimbabwe's minister of information, publicity, and broadcasting services, has confirmed that POTRAZ has received an application for an operating license from Starlink. The application is currently being reviewed, while Starlink plans to launch in Zimbabwe in Q2 2024</li> </ul>	<b>EXAMPLE 1</b> September 2023 Zimbabwe Government Makes U- turn on Starlink Approval, Reviews License Application





### Zimbabwe | Enabling environment

Access to finance and foreign currencies is a major challenge in Zimbabwe



G3

- In 2018, the Postal and Telecommunications Regulatory Authority of Zimbabwe (POTRAZ) was established, which is responsible for **regulating** and **promote competition** and **investment in the telecom sector**
- Operating licenses for mobile phone services are \$137.5 million, which hinders new players from entering the market
- Suppliers indicate that **license fee requirements can be stringent** for privately owned businesses
- PORTAZ has increased tariffs related to broadband and associated services for all telecommunications operators, because of the volatility in its national currency. Telecom operators may pass on these additional costs to customers, including schools

6 Because of the price controls, we cannot differentiate on price and therefore the focus is on optimizing costs. This has been one of the reasons why we have barely invested in infrastructure between 2014 and 2022 - MNO

	Zimbabwe's telecom regulation maturity is classified by ITU's ICT
J	Regulatory tracker as Generation 3: 'enabling investment &
	access' 1



- Access to mance
- An estimated \$36 million of upfront capital expenditure is needed to provide last mile connectivity to all underserved schools in Zimbabwe<sup>2</sup>
- The government also seeks to attract Foreign Direct Investments ("FDI") and has implemented the Zimbabwe Investment Authority (ZIA) to promote and facilitate foreign direct investment
- The amount of **FDI has risen to \$342 million in 2022** from \$250 million in 2021 but is still low compared to before the Covid-19 pandemic
  - Shortage of foreign currencies (mostly USD) is a major challenge. This limits investments and also results in high equipment costs, as equipment needs to be sourced from abroad and paid in dollars.
    - MNO

#### Access to finance indicators

- Exchange rate to USD: **0.00276** (2023)
- Government Debt to GDP (% of GDP): **93%** (2022)
- Interest rate: **130%** (2023)
- Domestic Credit to private sector (% of GDP)<sup>3</sup>: **12%** (2022)

#### Notes: 1) The ITU ICT Regulatory Tracker distinguishes four generations in telecom regulation maturity: G1 – Command & control approach, G2 – Early open markets, G3 – Enabling investment & access, G4 – Integrated regulation; 2) As estimated by Dalberg in 2020 based on Giga mapping and modelling data; 3) Domestic Credit to Private Sector refers to the financial resources provided to the private sector (such as through loans or purchases of non-equity securities) that establish a claim for repayment (source: OECD)

#### Sources: Postal and Telecommunications Regulatory Authority of Zimbabwe (POTRAZ), Giga, ITU, Trading Economics, Interviews, Deloitte Analysis

#### **Key takeaways**

- Availability: government price controls may hinder investments in expanding coverage
- Funding security: inadequate foreign currency reserves reduces market players' profitability and limits investments
- Funding security: hyperinflation and high interest rates lead to a lack of access to finance for investments into network expansion

### For more information, contact us at giga.global

United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) International Telecommunication Union (ITU)

www.unicef.org

3 United Nations Plaza New York, NY 10017 USA www.itu.int

Place des Nations 1211 Geneva 20 Switzerland



Deloitte refers to one or more of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited, a UK private company limited by guarantee ("DTTL"), its network of member firms, and their related entities. DTTL and each of its member firms are legally separate and independent entities. DTTL (also referred to as "Deloitte Global") does not provide services to clients. Please see About Deloitte for a detailed description of the legal structure of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited and its member firms.

In The Netherlands the services are provided by independent subsidiaries or affiliates of Deloitte Holding B.V., an entity which is registered with the trade register in The Netherlands under number 40346342.





